



Problems of Human Resources Fulfillment in Private Madrasah

^{1*}Afif Kholidin, ²Ida Nur Lailatul Kodriyah, ³Andi Nurannisa Syam, ⁴Saifudin Zuhri,
⁵Muhamad Ali Abdul Basit

^{1*} Islamic Center Demak Islamic College, ²Nahdlatul Ulama Islamic University of Jepara,
³Kendari State Islamic Institute, ⁴Ma'had Aly Al Iman Purworejo, ⁵Ma'had Aly Al Mubaarok
Manggisan

*Corresponding E-mail: kholidin.afif@gmail.com

Abstract

Teacher human resources remains a primary challenge within the Indonesian educational landscape, particularly in private madrasahs where educators are frequently assigned to subjects that do not align with their academic backgrounds. This study aims to identify the structural and situational barriers to HR fulfillment and formulate strategic solutions to address this systemic mismatch. Designed as a qualitative multi-site case study, this research involves a comparative analysis across three educational levels (MI, MTs, and MA) in Demak Regency. Data were gathered through semi-structured interviews with principals and heads of curriculum, non-participant observations, and documentation analysis, followed by an interactive model analysis. The results indicate that HR fulfillment is primarily obstructed by a lack of financial equity in national budget distribution, high teacher turnover due to P3K recruitment, and a structural shortage of linear-background educators willing to work in the private sector. To address these issues, the study proposes the policy integration of PPPK into private institutions, the expansion of PPG opportunities, and the strengthening of collaborative networks with community organizations. The novelty of this research lies in its comprehensive focus specifically on human resource challenges within private madrasahs from various angles and factors, setting it apart from broader studies on educational problems.

Keywords: cost of education, human resources, madrasah, quality of education, teacher professionalism

How to Cite: Kholidin, Afif., et al (2026). Problems of Human Resources Fulfillment in Private Madrasah. *Tarbiyah wa Ta'lim: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran*, 13(1) 107-122. doi: <https://doi.org/10.21093/twt.v13i1.10226>



<https://doi.org/10.21093/twt.v13i1.10226>

Copyright© 2026, Kholidin, Afif., et al

This is an open-access article under the [CC-BY License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).



INTRODUCTION

The quality of education is one of the main indicators for a country's progress. If the quality of education in a country improves, it will become a developed country more quickly. One of the most important efforts to create high quality of education is that the need for educational Human Resources (HR) must be fully satisfied, because resources play a large role in every activity in an institution, including educational institutions (Ningsih et al., 2022). The actualization of high-quality education necessitates a multifaceted synergy among specialized human resources (Tanjung, 2020).

As an emerging economy, Indonesia possesses the strategic potential to transition into a developed nation, contingent upon the efficacy and efficiency of its pedagogical framework. Nevertheless, empirical observations suggest a paradoxical decline in educational quality, which currently trails behind international benchmarks and continues to face systemic deterioration (Damayanti et al., 2023). This is caused by a number of educational problems faced by Indonesia, including macro problems such as complicated curriculum, gap between institutions, education costs, teacher placement, and the low quality of teaching human resources (Tarigan et al., 2023). An institution may have too many teachers, while the number of students is small, and another institution may have too few teachers, so that the teachers assigned to subjects that do not match their qualifications (Yulaini, 2017). This implies that teachers are compelled to instruct subjects outside their primary area of expertise merely to fill instructional vacancies. Consequently, this practice significantly impedes the quality of pedagogical delivery, rendering it difficult to achieve the intended learning objectives.

Teacher's quality is the key to improving the quality of education in Indonesia, however achieving it in accordance with the teacher professional standards which set by the Government is still difficult to achieve. The results of the analysis show that more than 60% of teachers are still below the standards set by the government (Madhakomala et al., 2022). The reason why professional standards for quality teachers are not fulfilled are still many educational gaps in Indonesia. Some of the educational gaps in Indonesia include: (1) The gap between education in urban and rural areas (Kawuryan et al., 2021). (2) The gap of economic welfare between teachers who have been recruited as Civil Servant (*Pegawai Negeri Sipil/PNS*) or Government Employees with Agreement (*Pegawai Pemerintah dengan Perjanjian Kerja/PPPK*) and private or honorary teachers, and between teachers who receive certification allowances and teachers who are not certified (Sulisworo et al., 2017). (3) The gap in rights and obligations between teachers in educational institutions under the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Religion (Mukhlisin, 2021).

Based on data from the Central Java,s Ministry of Religion, the number of madrasahs in Demak Regency is relatively large compared to other regions in Central Java. The total number consists of 132 *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah* (MI), 133 *Madrasah Tsanawiyah* (MTs), and 67 *Madrasah Aliyah* (MA). These institutions collectively accommodate approximately ±71,000 students distributed across all sub-districts in Demak (Team Humas Jateng, n.d.). This situation is particularly evident in the villages of Jogoloyo and Wonosalam. Based on observation results, within a distance of only about three kilometers from the urban center toward Wonosalam Village, there are five elementary schools (*Sekolah Dasar/SD*), three MI, three junior high schools (*Sekolah Menengah Pertama/SMP*), two MTs, one senior high school (*Sekolah Menengah Atas/SMA*), two MA, and three vocational high schools (*Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan/SMK*), illustrating the high concentration of educational institutions within a relatively small geographic area.

Generally, the human resources within madrasahs in Demak are predominantly concentrated in private institutions, where the majority of teachers are employed either as civil servants (PNS) or honorary staff. In compliance with national education standards, most educators hold at least a Bachelor's degree (S1), while several have attained a Master's degree (S2). However, a significant number of teachers have yet to obtain professional teaching certification. Teachers in state-run madrasahs tend to

exhibit higher certification rates, whereas a substantial proportion of educators in private madrasahs remain uncertified.

These preliminary observations were subsequently corroborated by field data from the research sites, revealing that human resources across all three locations are predominantly composed of honorary or non-PNS personnel. Despite the baseline educational qualifications of a Bachelor's or Master's degree, the human resource management in these institutions is fraught with systemic challenges. Notably, numerous teachers are assigned to subjects that are incongruent with their academic backgrounds. Furthermore, there is a noticeable migration trend of teachers transferring from private madrasahs to public schools upon securing positions under the PPPK scheme. Additionally, a large majority of private madrasah teachers lack educator certification from the Teacher Professional Education (PPG) program. More specifically, at the first research site, a segment of the teaching staff exhibits low motivation and enthusiasm for participating in professional development training. At the second site, the recruitment of PPPK personnel has resulted in teaching vacancies for specific subjects, thereby forcing unqualified teachers to fill these instructional gaps. Meanwhile, at the third site, the mismatch between teaching assignments and academic backgrounds is particularly pronounced. The madrasah administration intentionally assigns supplementary teaching hours outside the teachers' core qualifications (such as local content subjects) to help them secure an adequate honorarium to meet their daily living expenses.

This research is urgently required due to the widening gap between the pedagogical requirements of the curriculum and the actual distribution of teaching staff in the field. Preliminary data from interviews with the Madrasah Supervisor at the Ministry of Religion Office in Demak Regency indicates a systemic mismatch; numerous teachers are currently assigned to subjects that do not align with their academic backgrounds. This mismatch is not merely a logistical hurdle but a professional crisis, as Madrasahs face significant difficulty in recruiting educators who possess both the required linear expertise and the vocational commitment necessary for the private sector (Masrohan, 2024). If left unaddressed, this discrepancy threatens the academic integrity of private Madrasahs and hinders the implementation of the National Education Standards. Therefore, this study is conducted to provide an evidence-based analysis of these systemic barriers and to formulate strategic interventions. From the perspective of strategic human resource management, this research addresses the following problems: (1) What are the structural and situational barriers obstructing the fulfillment of qualified teaching staff in private Madrasahs? (2) What strategic solutions can be implemented by Madrasah management and the Ministry of Religion to optimize teacher recruitment and placement? The objective of this study is to diagnose the root causes of staff shortages and identify sustainable solutions to enhance the professional quality of private Madrasahs.

Previous researches used as literature reviews are; (1) *Human Resource Management in Improving The Quality of Education* written by Darul Qutni, Muhammad Kristiawan, and Yessi Fitriani. The research discusses HR management in improving the quality of education and its constraints (Qutni et al., 2021). (2) *Problems of Education in Indonesia and Alternative Solutions* by R. Madhakomala, M. Akrimul Hakim, and Nabillah Syifauzzuhrah. The study discusses the challenges and problems faced by Indonesia in education and finds several solutions (Madhakomala et al., 2022). (3) *PPPK Teacher Acceptance Policy and Impact on*

Private Education which researched by Nuraini Karim Damanik, Avif Ariyanto, and Farid Setiawan. This study discusses the PPPK appointment policy which is a detrimental action for private schools due to the recruitment of teachers and transfers to other schools (Damanik et al., 2022). The difference between this research and the first research is that this research focuses on HR problems to find solutions, whereas when compared to the second study, this research focuses more on discussing educational institutions called private *madrasahs*. And the difference between this research and the third research is that this research looks at teacher problems more broadly from various angles and factors.

RESEARCH METHOD

This study utilizes a qualitative-descriptive research design within a field research framework. This approach was selected to provide an in-depth, naturalistic exploration of the systemic and socio-economic factors influencing human resource fulfillment. The research is centered on three distinct levels of Islamic education (MI, MTs, and MA) in Demak Regency. The researchers selected these three locations based on the following strategic rationales: (1) Multi-Level Comparative Analysis: This approach aims to determine whether the challenges in human resource (HR) fulfillment are consistent or variable across these educational tiers. (2) Peri-Urban Educational Hub: This area features a highly dense concentration of educational institutions within a small geographical radius (approximately 3 km), encompassing a diverse array of primary and secondary schools (including SD, MI, SMP, MTs, SMA, MA, and SMK). (3) Evident Competitive Disparity: The institutional density in this location creates fierce competition for student enrollment, which directly impacts the financial stability of the *madrasahs* and their capacity to attract highly qualified teaching staff. (4) Urgency of Systemic Mismatch: Preliminary data from the Ministry of Religion Office in Demak Regency indicates a systemic mismatch at these locations, where numerous teachers are assigned to subjects that are incongruent with their academic backgrounds. (5) Representation of Private Madrasah Challenges: The site selection specifically targeted private *madrasahs* to capture the authentic administrative challenges confronted by school management, such as limited access to national funding and a heavy reliance on student tuition fees (*sumbangan pembinaan pendidikan/SPP*) for HR management. (6) Geographical Suitability and Subject Relevance: Purposive sampling was employed by considering administrative authority, institutional diversity, and geographical relevance to ensure the validity and depth of data regarding HR fulfillment within the private education sector.

The informants for this study were selected using a purposive sampling technique. In adherence to established ethical research protocols and to ensure institutional confidentiality, all participant identities and their respective affiliations have been rigorously anonymized. Participant profiles are designated as follows: Informant A, a principal at a private Islamic elementary school (MI); Informant B, a principal at a private Islamic junior high school (MTs); and Informant C, the head of curriculum at an private Islamic senior high school (MA). This research collects data from the location and subject of research through interview, observation, and documentation techniques.

To ensure data validity through methodological triangulation, data were gathered over a set period using three primary techniques: (1) Semi-structured Interviews: Conducted with a *Madrasah* Supervisor and three key institutional

informants. (2) Non-participant Observation: Researchers observed the administrative and pedagogical environment of the selected Madrasahs to identify the practical impact of teacher shortages and HR distribution deficits. (3) Documentation: An analysis was conducted on institutional documents, including teacher profiles, recruitment records, and the *Madrasah's* strategic planning files, to cross-reference verbal reports with objective data. The data were analyzed using the Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña Interactive Model, which ensures a continuous and cyclical analytical process. The analysis followed four essential stages; data collection, data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing and verification.

RESULT

The empirical findings of this study demonstrate that the quality of education in private madrasahs consistently falls below established national standards due to several unfulfilled institutional requirements and persistent bottlenecks in human resource management. Specifically, the fulfillment of teacher recruitment and retention is hindered by a complex interplay of systemic factors. The primary obstacles obstructing the optimization of human resources are categorized as follows.

High Teacher Turnover and Financial Insecurity

Data triangulated from semi-structured interviews and institutional records reveals a significant turnover rate among educators in private madrasahs. This trend is largely driven by the recruitment of teachers into the government's PPPK scheme, which fosters a perception of private madrasahs as merely transient platforms for professional development. This was articulated by Informant B: *"Yes, that is the reality; teachers who have passed the PPPK selection can no longer teach here. Private madrasahs merely serve as a training ground, a place to gain experience, and a stepping stone to becoming state teachers."* Furthermore, financial insecurity remains a primary catalyst for resignations, as private madrasahs face acute budgetary constraints in providing adequate compensation. As stated by Informant C, the madrasah under their leadership opens teaching vacancies almost every year due to frequent resignations among existing staff. Some teachers leave to pursue certification, while others feel the honorarium is insufficient to cover living expenses, prompting them to seek alternative employment. According to Informant C, prospective teachers perceive private madrasahs as offering low salaries because the income relies solely on student tuition fees. Meanwhile, madrasahs hesitate to set high tuition rates due to competition with tuition-free state schools. Informant B further elaborated: *"In state schools, teachers are salaried by the government, and there is a substantial flow of funds for infrastructure. Conversely, private madrasahs like ours must simultaneously manage teacher salaries and infrastructure needs. For madrasahs with low student enrollment and minimal income, teachers might not get paid at all."* Additionally, this financial and motivational deficit impacts professional engagement. As Informant A noted: *"There are still teachers who are reluctant to participate in training programs. This is due to a lack of awareness and enthusiasm for sharing knowledge and experiences, as well as low motivation to strive for self-improvement."*

Discrepancies in Academic Backgrounds and Teaching Mandates

Private madrasahs frequently encounter discrepancies between staff educational backgrounds and their professional responsibilities. Institutional leaders frequently resort to assigning subjects to educators outside their primary fields of expertise as a

strategic compensatory measure. This aligns with the statement from Informant C: *“There are also those who possess expertise in other subjects, enabling them to teach those courses. For instance, an Islamic Education (PAI) teacher who previously attended an Islamic boarding school (pesantren) and mastered Arabic can teach Arabic.”* In their institution, several subjects are taught by non-specialists, such as Computer Studies and Arts and Culture. This occurs due to the difficulty of recruiting subject-specific teachers, coupled with the intention to assist teachers with insufficient teaching hours so they can earn a higher salary. There are also teachers graduating from Islamic boarding schools who possess profound substantive knowledge in Arabic and classic Islamic texts (*Kitab Kuning*), yet they do not meet formal eligibility qualifications as they lack a Bachelor's degree (S1). According to Informant B, as long as the existing teachers have a grasp of the vacant subjects, they will be assigned those classes. For example, for local content subjects (*muatan lokal*) with minimal teaching hours, the administration does not rush to hire specialized teachers to prevent staff redundancy. This practice is primarily driven by the necessity to augment instructional hours so that teachers can secure a sufficient honorarium, leading to a precarious trade-off where pedagogical alignment is compromised.

Inequities in Professional Development and Certification

Educators face systemic inequities regarding professional development opportunities, particularly concerning access to the Teacher Professional Education (PPG) program. Internal documentation indicates that fewer than 25% of the teaching staff at the observed institutions have completed the program. Despite the high concentration of Islamic Education (PAI) instructors within the madrasah system, there is a discernible disparity in the allocation of certification quotas by the state, creating a critical scarcity of certified professional educators. As explained by Informant C: *“The teachers here who get the opportunity to participate in PPG and achieve certification are not our permanent staff; rather, they are the 'branching' teachers whose primary base is at public schools. They only teach here to accumulate additional teaching hours.”* Consequently, a significant number of teachers exhibit a strong preference for teaching in general public schools over madrasahs, particularly private ones. This sentiment was articulated by Informant B: *“Typically, applicants prefer to apply to general schools rather than madrasahs because they perceive that the Ministry of Education environment offers more promising career trajectories compared to the Ministry of Religion. Under Diknas, it is considerably easier to obtain certification or participate in the PPPK scheme.”*

Inter-Institutional Competition and Geographic Marginalization

The high density of educational institutions within certain vicinities creates an intensely competitive market for student recruitment. This geographical challenge is further compounded by the national zoning system policy, which inadvertently marginalizes private madrasahs located in suburban peripheries because prospective students predominantly gravitate toward state-funded institutions. The resulting decline in enrollment precipitates a financial crisis, which in turn diminishes their institutional attractiveness to high-quality teaching candidates. For instance, around the third research site, there are two Senior High Schools (SMA), two Vocational High Schools (SMK), and two Islamic Senior High Schools (MA). This density creates intense competition for student enrollment. This situation is critical because of the underlying reality that the number of students directly dictates the institution's

financial inflow, whether sourced from student tuition or School/Madrasah Operational Assistance (BOS/BOM) funds, which are allocated proportionally based on student headcount. As Informant C articulated: *“If the number of students is small, we face difficulties; the institutional income becomes minimal. If there are too few students, the school could face closure. Likewise, prospective teachers will certainly hesitate to apply if they see a low student enrollment.”*

DISCUSSION

The basic needs for educational institutions is to provide educational resources. Educational institutions must improve the quality of teacher qualifications and competencies along with improving their welfare. A teacher is required to be able to develop competence and keep up with the latest information technology developments (Masrohan, personal communication, May 25, 2024). Academic qualifications that teachers must fulfill are based on Minister of Education and Culture Regulation Num. 16 of 2007 concerning Academic Qualification Standards and Teacher Competencies, is an academic qualification through formal education and eligibility and equality tests. The teacher's formal education qualification is a minimum of a fourth diploma (D-IV) or bachelor's degree (S1) in accordance with the field or subject being taught and has a professional teacher certificate. The eligibility and equality test qualifications are the academic qualifications required to be appointed as a teacher in special fields that have not been developed in higher education. This qualification can be possessed by someone who has expertise without a diploma through a eligibility and equality test carried out by an authorized university (Lafendry, 2020). Based on research results in several private *madrasahs*, it was found that there were still teachers who did not meet their qualifications. There are teachers who teach subjects that do not match their educational background and there are teachers who have not yet graduated.

Teacher competencies include a deep understanding of the subject matter, effective classroom management skills, mastery of teaching methods, and good communication skills. Competent teachers can provide meaningful learning experiences, inspire students and help them reach their full potential. In this context, improving teacher competencies is crucial in achieving basic education goals (Yelfianita et al., 2023). However, based on the findings above, it is known that in some cases there are still teachers who are less competent. It can be said that HR in private *madrasahs* has not been met, therefore the need for HR in private madrasahs must be increased, but the fulfillment of these needs is hampered by several obstacles, namely high teacher turnover and financial insecurity, discrepancies in academic backgrounds and teaching mandates, inequities in professional development and certification, and inter-institutional competition and geographic marginalization. Consequently, it is imperative to formulate comprehensive solutions to overcome these challenges.

Restructuring Policy

The educational quality within private madrasahs in Indonesia frequently experiences a decline. This phenomenon is driven by several factors, including the appointment and subsequent migration of teachers to state-run educational institutions, constrained budgets for teacher honorariums, and persistent difficulties in recruiting professional educators whose expertise aligns with the required subjects. Consequently, private madrasahs face a severe shortage of human resources,

impacting both the quantity and the overall quality of their teaching staff. This is as explained by Informant B, the principal of an MTs in Demak, that teacher vacancies often occur because every teacher appointed by PPPK is placed in a state school or *madrasah*. Apart from that, sometimes there are teachers who feel that their welfare is not sufficiently guaranteed so they resign to change jobs, such as becoming entrepreneurs or other employees, as a result of which *madrasah* need to recruit teachers frequently. This explanation was confirmed by Informant C as Head of Curriculum in one of several MAs, that almost every year his MA opens job vacancies as teachers because new teachers often come in and out.

This is consistent with the phenomenon in China where local governments use teacher transfers to reward or punish teachers (Liu et al., 2016). In Sri Lanka, when state school teachers are transferred after 10 years of continuous service, the educational performance of the transferred individual may decline, which can be stressful for the teacher in charge (Herath, 2022). Teachers who are surplus in such schools may be transferred against their will. Besides that, there are difficulties in transferring teachers to rural schools due to the following factors: This relates to teacher's perceptions and accommodation conditions, the need for professional development, and the ignorance of the rural population. This includes the image of rural teachers as village teachers and the desire of teachers to stay in urban areas (Gementiza & Pernito, 2024).

Nowadays, finding a teacher is very easy. Many graduates are looking for work. Individuals who lack expertise tend to propose in educational institutions because according to applicants or prospective teachers that teaching is easy. According to Informant C, finding new teachers is very easy in today's global world. Many graduates need jobs, but getting professional teachers in their field of expertise is very difficult, because professionalism requires a long time, a lot of experience, and sufficient dedication. According to Informant B, teachers who have other skills can teach other subjects, such as PAI teachers who are graduates of Islamic boarding schools who have taken many Arabic lessons at Islamic boarding schools who are able to teach Arabic at *madrasah*.

The above discussion highlights the structural problematic and human resource management crisis within private *madrasahs*, particularly concerning the high teacher turnover rate. Private *madrasahs* frequently serve merely as stepping stones for educators before they transition to the PPPK track in state schools or other more financially promising professions. This welfare disparity is exacerbated by government policies, such as the zoning system and subsidy distribution, which create a dualism that heavily favors public or state-run schools. Consequently, although private *madrasahs* easily acquire new teachers from recent graduates, they face significant difficulties in recruiting and retaining truly professional educators. In the absence of affirmative government intervention, such as equitable wage subsidies for private teachers or the proportional placement of PPPK teachers in private *madrasahs*, these institutions will remain trapped in a cycle of financial crises and a deficit of professional educators, which ultimately disadvantages the students.

To address these structural problems, a comprehensive solution is required that bridges government policy interventions with the optimization of internal *madrasah* management. (1) Restructuring the Placement Policy for PPPK Teachers: The government must reconstruct regulations regarding the distribution of PPPK teachers to ensure a more equitable placement that is not exclusively concentrated in state

institutions. There needs to be a specific quota or special assignment scheme for PPPK teachers to serve in private madrasahs, thereby alleviating the financial burden on foundations and ensuring educational quality. Furthermore, affirmative policies are necessary in the form of cross-subsidies or operational funding assistance specifically allocated to support a minimum salary standard (welfare) for private teachers to prevent high turnover rates. (2) Evaluating the Implementation of the Zoning System: Regional governments and education policymakers must evaluate the implementation of the zoning system. The mapping of student quotas should proportionally incorporate the existence of private madrasahs, ensuring these institutions are not eroded or deprived of their student base, a situation which directly leads to institutional financial collapse. (3) Developing Educator Retention Strategies: From an internal managerial perspective, the foundations managing the madrasahs are required to develop adaptive educator retention strategies. Amidst financial limitations, madrasahs can design clear career development programs, facilitate continuous professional capacity building, and foster a supportive and collegial work climate. Non-financial incentives, such as teaching autonomy and recognition for dedication, can serve as alternative instruments to nurture teacher loyalty, ensuring that madrasahs are not merely stepping stones, but genuine homes for true expertise development.

Innovative Models

In terms of quantity, the ratio of teachers in *madrasahs* is still less than number of subjects taught in madrasahs. The number of subjects in *madrasahs* is more than in schools and the lack of financial income causes private *madrasahs* to try to provide as few teachers as possible. Consequently, teachers are compelled to teach multiple subjects, including those that are incongruent with their academic backgrounds. Whereas in terms of quality, some private *madrasah* teachers are still less professional in teaching because new teachers are not experienced enough and many teachers have not taken PPG, then there are teachers who do not match their expertise and duties, and there are still teachers whose formal education is below qualification standards (Efendi & Aprison, 2023).

Informant C said that there are two subjects held by teachers that are not in accordance with their educational background. This occurs in the local content (*muatan lokal*) subject and this is an additional duty for the teacher to help increase teaching hours, so that the teacher receives sufficient honorarium to ensure his welfare. *Madrasahs* do not seek teachers with appropriate educational backgrounds to fulfill subjects with a small number of hours, such as *mulok* subject to avoid the large costs incurred. If new teachers are recruited for each subject with a small number of hours, then the ratio of teachers in *madrasah* could be too large compared to the number of students, considering the large number of subjects being taught and of course it would cost more. Informant A as Principal of MI also explained that there are some teachers who their educational background is a subject teacher but teach at MI as class teachers because of the qualification policy which opens up opportunities for subject teachers so they can teach as class teachers at the elementary school level.

The preceding description reveals the pragmatic adaptation strategies of private madrasahs in navigating a dual dilemma: financial constraints and the demands of a dense curriculum workload. To suppress operational costs and maintain the teacher-student ratio, madrasahs distribute teaching loads without adhering to the teachers'

academic backgrounds (competency mismatch). This internal policy also serves a dual function as a means to secure teacher welfare through the fulfillment of teaching hours (and consequently, honorariums), even though this practice risks degrading professional standards and scientific linearity in the learning process. The practice of assigning teachers to instruct local content subjects (*muatan lokal*) merely to increase teaching hours, or the policy of allowing subject teachers to serve as classroom teachers in MI, demonstrates how regulatory loopholes are accommodated for institutional survival. While this survival strategy resolves the issue of teachers' administrative welfare in the short term, it gradually erodes the pedagogical quality of instructional delivery. On the other hand, this research also captures the uniqueness of the Islamic education ecosystem in its attempt to negotiate formal qualification standards with local intellectual traditions. The fact that high school graduates who are alumni of high-quality Islamic boarding schools (*pesantren*) are still granted the space to teach specific subjects, such as *Kitab Kuning* (classic Islamic texts), proves that madrasahs retain the autonomy to recognize actual competencies beyond the legitimacy of formal undergraduate degrees.

To minimize the negative impacts of this qualification mismatch and budget constraints, several strategic solutions can be implemented: (1) Implementation of a Resource Sharing Model: For subjects with minimal time allocation (such as local content or specific skills), several geographically proximate private madrasahs can form an educational consortium. They can recruit a single expert and professional teacher paid through a cost-sharing scheme to teach across multiple madrasahs on a mobile basis. This approach ensures that the expertise taught remains linear without fully burdening the finances of a single madrasah. (2) Optimization of Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL) and Local Certification: For educators who are scientifically competent but hindered by formal qualifications (such as *pesantren*-graduate clerics teaching *Kitab Kuning*), the government, through the Ministry of Religion, must expand access to credential equalization. An RPL program or specific competency certification can provide state-recognized professional legitimacy, allowing them to be counted in fulfilling minimum service standards without violating educator qualification regulations. (3) Institutionalization of Continuous Cross-Training: For teachers who are institutionally forced to teach subjects outside their educational backgrounds to fulfill working hours, foundations or madrasahs must include them in peer-mentoring programs. Madrasahs can utilize the Teacher Working Group (*Kelompok Kerja Guru/KKG*) or Subject Teacher Consultative Forum (*Musyawarah Guru Mata Pelajaran/MGMP*) at the cluster level so that these mismatched teachers receive pedagogical technical guidance from core or senior teachers who are genuine experts in their fields. This ensures that the classroom learning process is not merely about discharging an administrative obligation.

Integrated Solutions

The dualism of state and private education or general and religious education falls into the most obvious category because state institutions receive government subsidies while private institutions need to utilize a combination of funding sources. Government policies are also considered to favor general education. Most views focus on the impact of dualism that differentiates between religious and private education (Hidayati et al., 2023). *Madrasahs* are obliged to provide at least the same materials as schools for general subjects and must add lessons, so that the number of subjects in

madrasahs is greater than in schools, which results in the number of teachers needed in *madrasahs* being greater. The large number of subjects also makes student's learning focus on each subject lower, which causes the achievement of *madrasah* students in general to be lower than general school students (Arifai, 2018).

The impact of this dualism is the dichotomy of science, the cost of education is not affordable by the lower middle class, curriculum development is increasing but religious, cultural and social values are deteriorating, and the world of education is becoming a political arena (Hidayati et al., 2023). This makes *prospective* teachers are more likely to prioritize proposing as teachers at schools rather than *madrasahs*. *Madrasahs* allocate funds for teacher salaries from SPP alone, so that if the number of students is smaller, the funds that enter the institution will be smaller. As stated by Informant B, teachers more prefer to propose at schools than *madrasahs* because they think that Ministry of Education will be more promising for their career path than at Ministry of Religion. In contrast to Informant A's explanation that the welfare of teachers is quite guaranteed in MI, because most of them have received teacher certification allowances. Meanwhile, Informant C admitted that as a private *madrasah* which relies on fees from students as the largest financial source and could even be said to be the only source of funds, he feels that the salary given is in accordance with the capabilities of the institution and the duties given to teachers.

General subjects included in *madrasahs* are considered as part of politics because the portion of religious subjects in *madrasahs* is decreasing (Muhajir, 2019). It is explained in the Decree of the Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 17 of 1978, Article 2, that MA is tasked with the field of education and teaching of Islamic values of at least 30% as basic subjects in addition to general subjects (KMA, 1987).

Furthermore, the number of private *madrasah* teachers who have successfully completed the PPG program remains limited. Every teacher must take teacher professional education so that he can become a professional teacher in teaching and producing quality students. However, in reality not all teachers have the opportunity to take part in this education. Private *madrasahs* have very little opportunity to participate in professional teacher education. Informant C said that it is very rare for teachers at his MA to have the opportunity to take part in PPG. Most of the PPG participants are school teachers, while *madrasah* teachers get fewer opportunities, especially PAI teachers, even though there are more PAI teachers in *madrasahs* than schools. Some of teachers who teach at this MA who can take PPG and pass certification are not institution's permanent teachers, but non-permanent teachers whose homebase is in general schools. At MTs under Informant B leadership, less than 25% of teachers have taken PPG. Meanwhile, according to Informant A, there are teachers who are reluctant to take part in training to develop their profession, due to low awareness and enthusiasm for sharing knowledge and experience, and low motivation to try to develop their own qualities.

From this description, it can be said that the issue of human resource quality in private *madrasahs* is not merely an internal managerial problem, but rather the product of discriminatory national education policies that perpetuate a dualism. The regulatory demand for *madrasahs* to implement a general curriculum equivalent to state schools, without being counterbalanced by commensurate financial subsidies and equitable access to teacher capacity building, constitutes a form of structural injustice. This disparity forces managing foundations into a survival mode,

compelling them to tolerate practices such as teaching qualification mismatches to suppress operational costs. Ironically, when teacher quality declines due to a lack of professional development facilities, the madrasahs themselves bear the blame and are increasingly abandoned by middle-to-upper-class society. However, amidst this structural adversity, the findings above also underscore the crucial role of madrasah principal leadership. HR management theory demonstrates that external constraints can be mitigated through visionary leadership. When the state fails to provide equitable support, the madrasah principal, acting as a manager, must be capable of adopting business organization principles to empower existing HR. Unfortunately, current innovations frequently remain trapped in superficial, image-oriented curriculum alterations on paper, rather than engaging in holistic governance reform that addresses the root causes of teacher welfare and pedagogical capacity enhancement.

To break this deadlock, interventions ranging from macro-level policies to micro-level institutional strategies are imperative: (1) Restructuring the Madrasah Curriculum Workload: Rather than forcing madrasahs to mimic general public schools with a 70% general subject load that burdens operational capacity, the government should permit madrasahs to streamline or fuse general subjects (e.g., integrated natural and social sciences). Consequently, madrasahs can return to their original mandate (*khittah*) of focusing on in-depth religious studies and character building, while simultaneously reducing the need for massive teacher recruitment. (2) Affirmative Access to PPG and Private Teacher Welfare: The Ministry of Religion must advocate for equitable and affirmative quota allocations for private madrasah teachers in the PPG program. Furthermore, a cross-financing scheme derived from the National or Regional State Budget (APBN/APBD) is required, specifically allocated to subsidize the salaries and certification of private teachers. This ensures their welfare is not solely dependent on SPP from parents who predominantly belong to the lower-middle economic class. (3) Strategic Partnerships and Leadership Optimization: From a managerial perspective, madrasah principals must adopt professional governance principles. Educational foundations cannot operate in isolation. Madrasahs must forge strategic collaborations with the private sector (through Corporate Social Responsibility/CSR), Islamic civil society organizations, and philanthropic entities (such as optimizing *zakat* and *waqf* funds) to establish an endowment fund. These funds can be utilized to guarantee teacher welfare and finance independent professional training, thereby enabling the madrasah to transform from a perceived second-class institution into a self-reliant and competitive Islamic educational entity.

Policy Intervention

Madrasah's need for educational infrastructure is considered the same and parallel to that of schools. With a greater number of subjects being taught, of course the need for *madrasah* facilities and infrastructure is greater, such as the need for religious reference books and religious laboratories. However, *madrasahs* have not received a fair education budget. *Madrasah* building facilities, renovations and provision of educational support equipment are very minimal. (Efendi & Aprison, 2023) The main income for education costs in private *madrasahs* comes from students whose nominal value is still far from being able to meet the needs for educational facilities and infrastructure. *Madrasahs* have the authority to seek and utilize various sources of funds according to their respective needs, because finance and financing

are one of the resources that directly support the effectiveness and efficiency of education management (Kurniawati et al., 2023).

This is in accordance with what Informant C said, that his MA is in an educational area. Within a distance of 2 kilometers there are 2 SMA, 2 SMK, and 2 MA. This situation creates competition in finding students which causes private *madrasahs* to experience difficulties, coupled with the existence of a zoning system which results in schools located on the outskirts of the city such as Informant C's MA having fewer students. Students who live around state educational institutions will flock to register there, because they see the free fees and feel more facilitated. A geostrategy supports this MA because of its location close to the Islamic boarding school. There are 3 large Islamic boarding schools surrounding this MA so he has no difficulty finding students. Informant B's explanation supports Informant C, who stated that state schools where state teachers also receive salaries from the government, so schools do not need to think about salaries for their teachers. Meanwhile, private *madrasahs* are still thinking about salaries for teachers. *Madrasahs* have a limited number of students, resulting in little income for educational institutions. *Madrasahs* have to think about educational facilities and infrastructure as well as think about teacher salaries, so they experience funding difficulties.

Based on the preceding description, there is a crippling dual crisis suffocating private *madrasahs*: an infrastructure financing deficit and an existential threat driven by geographical competition and zoning policies. Absolute reliance on SPP places *madrasahs* in a highly vulnerable position due to the double burden of financing educational facilities and teacher salaries simultaneously. The presence of surrounding Islamic boarding schools (*pesantren*) becomes the sole geostrategic savior to guarantee student enrollment. Conversely, *madrasahs* lacking such geographical affiliation support remain trapped in a vicious cycle. This reaffirms the structural disparity and the state's failure to distribute fiscal justice for the private religious education sector. The normative demand for *madrasahs* to possess facilities on par with general public schools, even with greater specific needs such as religious laboratories and classic text literature is highly contradictory to the minimal allocation of government subsidies. This condition is exacerbated by the implementation of the zoning system and the narrative of free schooling in state institutions, which inadvertently marginalizes peripheral private *madrasahs*. From the perspective of sociology and educational management, this exposes the fragile resilience of private *madrasahs*, whose survival is heavily dictated by external geostrategy. Spatial mutual symbiosis with *pesantren* has indeed proven to be an effective survival tactic to secure student input. However, for *madrasahs* lacking this geographical privilege, the reality is starkly harsh. A low student headcount triggers a destructive domino effect: institutional financial paralysis. This subsequently elicits economic rationality among prospective teachers; they will avoid *madrasahs* with low enrollment because, mathematically, these institutions will be incapable of guaranteeing adequate welfare and a viable future career.

To break this chain of facility, financing, and student competition issues, several strategic measures can be undertaken: (1) Cross-Subsidy Intervention and Zoning Implementation Revision: The government must evaluate the destructive impact of the zoning system on the existence of private educational institutions. There must be regulations incorporating private *madrasahs* into the integrated regional New Student Admission (PPDB) scheme, wherein the overflow of state school quotas is

distributed to madrasahs, backed by additional Educational Operational Cost (BOP) subsidies specifically earmarked for infrastructure development and physical facility fulfillment. (2) Institutional Strengthening of the Madrasah-Pesantren Symbiosis: For madrasahs situated in *pesantren* areas, this geostrategic advantage must not be left to operate merely organically. Madrasah and *pesantren* foundations need to bind themselves through a formal Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) that integrates the curriculum and student management. This "Pesantren-Based Madrasah" model can serve as a unique selling proposition that state schools lack, enabling madrasahs to no longer compete on the completeness of general public facilities, but rather on academic excellence and student (*santri*) character building. (3) Funding Diversification Through Edu-Sociopreneurship: To break free from absolute reliance on SPP, private madrasah management must innovate to explore alternative funding sources. This can be achieved by establishing madrasah-owned business units (such as multi-purpose cooperatives, printing presses, or school catering services) that involve alumni and the surrounding community. Furthermore, optimizing the management of Islamic philanthropic funds (*Zakat*, *Infaq*, *Sadaqah*, and productive *Waqf*) must become a financial pillar of the madrasah. With financial independence, madrasahs can construct their own facilities and guarantee their educators' welfare without constantly waiting for government disbursements.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The provision of qualified teaching staff in private madrasahs is severely obstructed by an intersection of structural and situational barriers. Structurally, the primary impediments stem from a discriminatory national education dualism, inequitable national budget distribution, and unequal access to the PPG program. Moreover, the government's PPPK recruitment scheme and the zoning system disproportionately favor public schools, triggering a high teacher turnover rate and positioning private madrasahs as mere stepping stones for educators. Situationally, private madrasahs suffer from acute financial insecurity due to their absolute reliance on SPP amid intense geographical competition for enrollment. This financial deficit compels management to adopt pragmatic survival strategies, frequently assigning teachers to subjects outside their academic expertise to distribute teaching hours and secure adequate honorariums, which ultimately degrades professional pedagogical standards. Based on these findings, the researchers highly recommend that educational policymakers formulate a unified regulatory framework that guarantees fiscal justice and professional equity for the private religious education sector. Madrasah administrators are advised to proactively diversify their operational funding sources beyond traditional tuition fees and formalize strategic resource-pooling partnerships with surrounding community institutions. For future research, it is recommended to expand the geographical scope of the study beyond a single regency to a provincial or national scale to determine the broader applicability of these systemic patterns. Additionally, employing quantitative or mixed-methods research designs to measure the direct statistical correlation between teacher turnover rates, competency mismatches, and student academic achievement in private madrasahs would provide critical empirical data to strengthen future policy advocacy.

REFERENCES

- Arifai, A. (2018). Pengembangan Kurikulum Pesantren, Madrasah dan Sekolah. *Raudhah Proud To Be Professionals Jurnal Tarbiyah Islamiyah*, 3(2), 13–20.
- Damanik, N. K., Ariyanto, A., & Setiawan, F. (2022). Kebijakan Penerimaan PPPK Guru dan Dampak terhadap Pendidikan Swasta. *Masaliq*, 2(3), 354–360. <https://doi.org/10.58578/masaliq.v2i3.379>
- Damayanti, F., Vivien, H., Situmorang, M., Trianung, T., & Supadi. (2023). The Problem of Education in Indonesia is The Independent Curriculum The Solution. *Scholarr: Media Educational Scientific Journal Homepage*, 13(5), 917–924.
- Efendi, D., & Aprison, W. (2023). Madrasah Problem dan Solusi Pengembangannya. *Jurnal Penelitian Ilmu Pendidikan Indonesia*, 2(1), 39–46.
- Eka, F. S. P., Khadamul, M. W., & Mardiyah. (2023). Sarana dan Prasarana pada Madrasah atau Sekolah untuk Meningkatkan Kualitas Pembelajaran. *Enggang: Jurnal Pendidikan, Bahasa, Sastra, Seni, Dan Budaya*, 4(1), 697–711.
- Gementiza, J. G., & Pernito, F. B. (2024). Accounts Of Public Elementary School Teachers On Involuntary Transfer Of Station: A Phenomenology Involuntary Transfers Of Teachers. *EPRA International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research*, 10(1), 389–397. <https://doi.org/10.36713/epra2013>
- Herath, T. N. (2022). Allocation of teachers among public schools and minimization of cost: The case of public education in Sri Lanka. *Asian Journal of Comparative Politics*, 7(4), 849–860. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2057891120935993>
- Hidayati, N., Muhid, A., & Sahri, I. K. (2023). Educational Dualism in Indonesia: Systematic Literature Review. *Tarbiyatuna*, 14(2), 130–146.
- Kawuryan, S. P., Sayuti, S. A., Aman, & Dwiningrum, S. I. A. (2021). Teachers Quality and Educational Equality Achievements in Indonesia. *International Journal of Instruction*, 14(2), 811–830. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2021.14245a>
- Kurniawati, R., Badrussyamsi, & SS., S. (2023). The “Four Pathways” Madrasah Principal’s Management Strategy In Improving Teacher Commitment. *Journal of Educational Research*, 2(2), 331–346.
- Lafendry, F. (2020). Kualifikasi dan Kompetensi Guru dalam Dunia Pendidikan. *Tarbawi: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 3(1), 1–16.
- Liu, S., Zhao, D., & Xie, W. (2016). Chinese teachers’ attitudes toward performance pay: The cases of three schools. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 30(6), 791–808. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJEM-06-2015-0074>
- Madhakomala, R., Hakim, M. A., & Syifauzzuhrah, N. (2022). Problems of Education in Indonesia and Alternative Solutions. *International Journal of Business, Law, and Education*, 3(2), 135–144. <https://doi.org/10.56442/ijble.v3i3.64>
- Muhajir. (2019). The Curriculum of Madrasah Aliyah in The National Education System in Indonesia: The Shift Analysis. *International Conference on Community Development*, 349(6), 345–349.
- Ningsih, A. R., Mentari, S., Julyanto, R., Safrudin, Santi, & Dewi, O. S. (2022). The Development of Educational Human Resources Through Indonesia’s

- Education System. *Interdisciplinary Social Studies*, 1(4), 334–345. <https://doi.org/10.55324/iss.v1i4.70>
- Qutni, D., Kristiawan, M., & Fitriani, Y. (2021). Human Resource Management in Improving The Quality of Education. *Edunesia : Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan*, 2(2), 354–366. <https://doi.org/10.51276/edu.v2i2.132>
- Sulisworo, D., Nasir, R., & Maryani, I. (2017). Identification of Teachers' Problems in Indonesia on Facing Global Community. *International Journal of Research Studies in Education*, 6(2), 81–90. <https://doi.org/10.5861/ijrse.2016.1519>
- Surat Keputusan Menteri Agama Republik Indonesia, Pub. L. No. 17, 17 Susunan Organisasi dan Tata Kerja Madrasah Aliyah Negeri (MAN) (1987).
- Tanjung, B. N. (2020). Human Resources (HR) In Education Management. *Budapest International Research and Critics in Linguistics and Education (BirLE) Journal*, 3(2), 1240–1249. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birle.v3i2.1056>
- Tarigan, R. A., Saptono, A., & Muchtar, S. (2023). Enhancing Indonesia's Education Quality: Identifying and Addressing Key Challenges. *1st International Students Conference on Business, Education, Economics, Accounting, and Management (ISC-BEAM)*, 659–670.
- Undang-Undang RI, Pub. L. No. 14, Pasal 4 Guru dan Dosen (2005).
- Yelfianita, S., N., & Irdamurni. (2023). Improving Teacher Competence in Supporting the Achievement of Basic Education Goals. *International Journal of Educational Dynamics*, 5(2), 232–242.
- Yulaini, E. (2017). Analisis Kebijakan Pendidikan Terhadap Tenaga Kerja Kependidikan dalam Menghadapi Masyarakat Ekonomi Asean (MEA). *Jurnal Neraca: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Ilmu Ekonomi Akuntansi*, 1(1), 36–48.