

Projecting Professional Islamic Teachers: Evidence from IAIN Surakarta

Siti Choiriyah

IAIN Surakarta, Indonesia
e-mail: choiriain@gmail.com

Kumaidi

Muhammadiyah University of Surakarta, Indonesia
e-mail: kum231@ums.ac.id

Badrun Kartowagiran

State University of Yogyakarta, Indonesia
e-mail: badrunkn@yahoo.com

Abstract

This study examines the quality and features associated with studying six study programs. It examines the quality of FITK in IAIN Surakarta with respect to their readiness to prepare professional teachers to teach students internalized Islamic values. The methodology adopted in carrying out this research study is the descriptive quantitative with no treatment design using 196 participants. Data was collected using Delta Internal Quality Assurance derived to evaluate Islamic higher education institutions. The instrument consisted of 10 sets of questionnaires, 7 evaluation dimensions, and 477 questionnaire items. The results obtained, show that all six study programs receive very good quality in seven dimensions, namely: vision and mission, curriculum, competency of lecturers and staffs, infrastructure and facilities, teaching learning process, student development supervisory, and graduate competency. Similarly, it showed that FITK being the institution's umbrella, also has good reputation with seven dimension. From the analysis obtained, both FITK and the six study programs are ready to produce Islamic professional teachers as indicated by the graduate competency.

Keywords: quality assurance, Islamic university, Delta Internal Quality Assurance, professional teachers

A. Introduction

This study analyzes and presents the results of evaluation of internal quality of six study programs in the Faculty of Islamic Education and Teaching (FITK) in IAIN Surakarta. The study made use of Delta Internal Quality Assurance (DIQA). The evaluation was conducted for two essential reasons. Firstly, it was carried out because Islamic higher education institutions performed poorly requiring the need for internal quality assurance practices. Secondly, the study was carried out because a new instrument model of internal quality assurance for the Islamic higher education institutions has just been created. The instrument was created as a part of the doctorate dissertation named DIQA. This left a whole lot of people with the curiosity to implement the instrument. DIQA gives focus on internal quality assurance of Islamic university and the results of evaluation will be visible to project professional teachers graduated from the Islamic university.

This study focuses on three stands. First, this study illuminates the various programs associated with the teaching profession development in Indonesia. It darts the teaching profession development processes, and how the university puts the standard of teaching services. Secondly, this study takes a look at the standard conduct of teaching accepted by the Indonesian government. Thirdly, it is concerned with the quality of the Islamic institutions provided by teacher with the need for accountability.

Kennedy (2016) beamed that teachers are charged with the responsibility of teaching and educating students on things that they weren't privileged to learn as students, or on things that they weren't opportune to learn during their teaching program. Owing to the great demand for students to acquire more knowledge and higher stake for more professional graduates in the labor market, there is the increasing need for professional development of students in their various fields of study. There has been a wide analysis of teachers' professional development in all areas and fields of study. Various analyses obtained proved that inadequate and substandard support and development of teachers is one of the sole reasons for the poor development of students. Similarly, professional development is essential to the proper development of teachers and students as a whole.

The idea of the professional development, according to Kennedy (2016) can foster teaching improvements if widely accepted. Yet, there is little consensus about how these professional development works, such as, what happens in professional development, how it fosters teachers learning, and how it is expected to alter teaching practice. Kennedy (2016) asserts that professional development varies from: subject matter and pedagogy; substantive foci: generic teaching practices, subject-specific teaching practices, curriculum and pedagogy, and how students learn. Others focus on the various features of program design; follow-up steps in teachers' schools, active learning methods, collective participation, and substantive attention to how students learn specific content; the content and process of the programs, the characteristics of the teachers' schools, and the social context of their work.

B. Review of Literature

1. Teacher Professional Development

According to Richards (2015), teacher professional development scheme is made up of teacher training and development. Teacher training consists of the development

and creation of basic concepts, principles, and theories acquired through observation and practical-teaching. With reference to the teacher development concept, proper and adequate teaching can be defined as the act of understanding and mastering the field of study. Furthermore, teacher development facilitates the assimilation of growth and understanding of the performance of a student. As a teacher, teacher development is essential and is professionally acquired by undergoing various teachers training. According to Richard (2015), teacher development requires the development of the following skills:

- Disciplinary knowledge: Having a thorough understanding of the course
- Pedagogical expertise.. This is the act of mastering new teaching fields, improving various teaching abilities and adding new ideas to one's area of teaching specialization notwithstanding your age and professional background.
- Learners understanding: This involves the act of understanding the various techniques used in making learners understand what you are trying to teach. The problems, inconsistencies, and difficulties associated with learning and learners understanding.
- Understanding the curriculum and materials Making one have a wider understanding of the curriculum initiatives, and the educational materials
- Research skills. Having an ideal research knowledge and the approaches used to investigate and carry out a conserved classroom research.
- Career advancement.. This can be described as the process of acquiring the essential knowledge and expertise needed for personal advancement.

Teacher's professional relationship with students, colleagues, parents, school management and the public is dependent on trust. Tam (2001) opined that higher institutions should implement strategies to display assurance and to implement the development of professional teachers. Implementing internal quality assurance is currently in trend and in greater demand in higher educational institutions owing to the high competitive demand globally (Patil & Pudlowski, 2005). In addition to this, the urgent need for measuring the product for the benchmarking system (Rita & Shokrpour, 2011) is also one its essential reasons. The internal quality assurance is useful for the accountability of education management where in the global era online information becomes the basic needs for the management. This way, the education program can be assessed to see if the target objective has been achieved so that the results will be useful as the benchmarking.

2. Quality Assurance

Some of the major inconsistencies or issues currently faced by Indonesia are related to the low quality education, low quality higher education institutions, and the fact that the graduates produced are up to standard market value. OECD (2015:37) reports that most universities have limited international links to create a conducive academic atmosphere. Top 92 Indonesian universities are rated fair to middling. However, among 3,000 private universities situated in the country, most are rated poor and with many rated very poor. Furthermore, lecturers of many higher institutions on Indonesia are unqualified with poor monthly salaries. This is pretty discouraging compared to those of the international neighboring communities. The educational

quality of most Indonesian universities is extremely poor. These results to the production of half-baked graduates unfit for the labor market. In addition to this, there is a huge backlog of unaccredited programs and educational institutions.

OECD (2015) further beams that the reports quality of teacher training programs in Indonesia is problematic. There are about 32 public and 342 private teaching training institutions in Indonesia, with a large quality of student's intake, teacher training and graduate output. There are not only limited supplies of demand, but there are serious deficiencies associated with teaching students effectively and helping them to learn. Many higher educational institutions are unaccredited with a large shortage of advanced human capital. Accreditation capacity must be strengthened and stronger regulation must be implemented in order to address institutions with low quality academic services. To achieve the world benchmarks, it will be necessary to improve investment and internationalization of research capacity among universities.

A good number of degree programs offered in these Indonesian universities are not up to standard with the needs of the labor industry. Analysis has it that only about 16% graduates study engineering, construction and manufacturing. Most employers of labor have beamed that graduate lack the relevant skills and expertise.

In an analysis, carried out by the OECD, the educational system carried out by these numerous educational institutions on Indonesia, is questionable. According to Zhang and Patil (2017), the cornerstone to having a quality and standard education is to define that which needs to be evaluated. The role played by teachers and the higher educational institutions has changed the management of higher education policy (Chinta, Kebritchi, & Ellias, 2016). Zang and Patil (2017), further beamed that evaluation, assessment, accreditation, review and other quality assurance activities are essential for the proper development of quality education system in Indonesia

According to Tam (2001), the key for quality assurance, is to keep the widest possible academic community, starting from teachers to students and the administrative staff informed. This will put quality assurance into practice and implement it on their respective institutions (Tam, 2001). Globally, expansion of higher educational institutions, has put information on academic quality as a benchmarking for the university. According to Rossi, et. al. (2004) universities must introduce systematic evaluations of education at departmental, faculty and university levels. Attempts to measure quality in higher education should be based on purpose and major goals. The assessment program should reflect what constitutes the quality in higher education, determine the outcomes to be measured, and the approach to be used in measuring them (Tam, 2001).

There is a close relationship between quality assurance, benchmark, and measurement. Chinta, Kebritchi, & Ellias (2016) opined that what you input is what you output. This means that the amount of education or learning effort you input, is what you will obtain at the end. What benchmark you use is what you will end up getting. In addition to this, Rich, Lepine, and Crawford (2010) stated that benchmarking is using a specific benchmark to evaluate a standard.

The high competitive pressure to achieve a better education in higher institutions is great concern for students and the public as a whole (Patil & Pudlowski, 2005).. Similar to the industries the higher educational industries are of the opinion quality measurable product or services are achievable when expectations or requirements are

met. Quality can be represented by the product reviews evaluated by customer's feedback. The quality of an institution is determined by the effective and efficient use of educational resources and its ability to produce employable graduates. Koslowski (2006) defined quality as an attribute defined by the customer, with management being responsible for the quality, and how quality can be improved.

The government of Indonesia has conducted a quality assurance research through BAN-PT (National Accreditation Body for the Higher Education) (2002) to control the quality of higher education institutions. BAN-PT classifies quality educational institution as: (1) shared understanding and commitment to high goals, (2) open communication and collaborative problem solving, (3) continuous assessment for teaching and learning, (4) personal and professional learning, (5) resources to support teaching and learning, and (6) curriculum and instruction. However, critics have beamed that, BAN-PT does not fully implement the accreditation as there are different treatments for different universities and the focus of accreditation for Islamic universities may shed out Islamic values not covered in the evaluation (Fitri, 2016:209).

Inspired by the above listed conditions, we try to evaluate the internal quality assurance of FITK in IAIN of Surakarta. The practices of internal quality assurance of IAIN Surakarta indicate disharmony with the objectives. Choiriyah (2018) beams that the evaluation is using AMI (Internal Management Audit) conducted by the consultant. The focus of AMI is on administrative process and not on the competency of lecturers, staff, and graduates. In a bid to provide an answer to the problems, Choiriyah (2018) developed DIQA. This was used to improve the weaknesses of previous tool used to measure the quality assurance. This study, therefore, aims at measuring the internal quality of FITK in IAIN Surakarta. The study makes use of two research questions as listed below:

1. What is the quality of study programs in FITK IAIN Surakarta and quality of FITK that is evaluated using DIQA?
2. How is the readiness of each study program and FITK in IAIN Surakarta projected to serve professional teachers?

C. Research Methodology

Descriptive study was used to explore how students and teachers study programs in FITK and FITK of IAIN Surakarta in a bid to prepare themselves for the internalize Islamic values. The main focus of the research object was FITK of IAIN Surakarta; and the study programs of FITK which includes: Islamic Education (IE), Early Childhood Islamic Education (ECIC), Teacher Education for Islamic Elementary School (TEIES), Arabic Language (AL), Indonesian Language Education Unit (ILEU), and English Language Education (ELE). The quality of each study program was evaluated using two criteria: scores of evaluation results to see 7 dimensions of quality, that are: vision and mission, curriculum, competency of lecturer and staff, infrastructure and facilities, student supervisory development, teaching learning process, and graduate competency.

This study made use of descriptive quantitative design with no treatment. The instrument used on the analysis and evaluation of this study was DIQA (Delta Internal Quality Assurance). The instrument was specifically devised to evaluate Islamic higher education institution by Choiriyah (2018). The DIQA consisted of 10 sets of questionnaires, 7 dimensions to evaluate, and 477 items to select the information. The

participants recruited as the research subjects included 4 leaders of 4 different faculties, 12 heads of study programs, 60 lecturers in six study programs, and 120 students from six study programs, with the total 196 respondents. The participants were selected using purposive sampling technique, considering the authority of participants that include leaders of faculty, head of study programs, and the availability and readiness that apply to select lecturer and students.

Procedures used to collect data were as follows: Faculty leaders, head of study programs and lecturers were invited to answer questions in the DIQA. They were grouped in same category; 120 students were also grouped in different categories to answer the DIQA's questions. In the preceding steps, head of faculty, head of study programs, and lecturers were invited to assess the answers of the DIQA questions. Together with the researcher, they rated the answers and make decision to judge the quality of each dimension of the questionnaire. The results were analyzed using f the quality of seven dimensions. The results showed that a study program, may be scored low to very good quality. Based on the level of evaluation, each study program indicated how well it was ready to project the Islamic professional teachers.

D. Findings and Discussion

This study aims at evaluating the quality of the results obtained in the six study programs in FITK IAIN Surakarta and the quality of FITK. In addition to this, analysis was carried out to determine how ready institutions of FITK and its study programs prepare Islamic professional teachers.

1. Quality of Each Study Program

This section analyzes the results obtained from quantitative evaluation. Dimensions to evaluate include seven stands: vision and mission, curriculum, lecturer and staff, infrastructure and facilities, teaching learning process, students supervisory, and graduate competency.

a. Islamic Education Study Program

IE program achieved a mean score of 3.75, which is an excellent quality. As shown in table 1, the result from the evaluation evidently proves that this study program has been designed to prepare professional teachers. Seven dimensions were used which proved to be fundamentally useful to be used as the main indicators show the readiness to produce professional teachers. The quality supports the evidence that IE Study Program receives status A from BAN-PT accreditation.

Table 1. Quality evaluation os IESP

Evaluation	No	Dimension	Score	Category
Input	1	Vision and mission	3,96	Very Good
	2	Curriculum	3,94	Very Good
	3	Lecturer & staff	3,45	Very Good
	4	Infrastructure & facilities	3.59	Very Good
Mean of Input			3,74	Very Good
Process	5	Teaching learning process	3,85	Very Good
	6	Supervisory of students	3,90	Very Good
Mean of process			3,88	Very Good
Output	7	Graduate competency	3,40	Very Good
Mean of output			3,40	Very Good
Mean of evaluation			3,67	Very Good

b. Early Childhood Islamic Education Study Program

ECIE study program is accredited A by BAN-PT and the result obtained from the evaluation using DIQA is "very good". Each of the seven dimensions evaluated provide very good results. Table 2 illustrates the results of the quality evaluation.

Table 2. Result of Evaluation of ECIE Study Program

Evaluation	No	Dimension	Score	Category
Input	1	Vision and mission	4,0	Very Good
	2	Curriculum	3,88	Very Good
	3	Lecturer & staff	3,54	Very Good
	4	Infrastruktur & facilities	3,60	Very Good
Mean of Input			3,75	Very Good
Process	5	Teaching learning process	3,76	Very Good
	6	Supervisory	3,96	Very Good
Mean of process			3,86	Very Good
Output	7	Graduate competency	3,39	Very Good
Mean of output			3,39	Very Good
Mean of evaluation			3,66	Very Good

c. Arabic Education Study Program

AE study program obtained "excellent" status (score 3.59) as seen in Table 3. Vision and mission obtained very good criteria, lecturer competence and employees in general categorized all had "very good" status grade with score 3,51.

Table 3. Result of evaluation of Arabic Education Study Program

Evaluation	No	Dimension	Score	Category
Input	1	Vision and mission	3,93	Very Good
	2	Curriculum	3,51	Very Good
	3	Lecturer & staff	3,91	Very Good
	4	Infrastructure & facilities	3,51	Very Good
Mean of Input			3,71	Very Good
Process	5	Teaching learning process	3,76	Very Good
	6	Supervisory	3,81	Very Good
Mean of process			3,78	Very Good
Output	7	Graduate competency	3,29	Very Good
Mean of output			3,59	Very Good
Mean of evaluation			3,50	Very Good

d. English Language Education Study Program

Results of evaluation on all seven dimensions achieved by the ELE are displayed in Table 4. The table suggests that ELE achieves good and very good criteria on all seven dimension of evaluation. The status is "excellent" with a score of 3.45.

Table 4. Result of evaluation of English Language Education

Evaluation	No	Dimension	Score	Category
Input	1	Vision and mission	3,83	Very Good
	2	Curriculum	3,31	Very Good
	3	Lecturer & staff	3,66	Very Good
	4	Infrastructure & facilities	3,54	Very Good
Mean of Input			3,36	Very Good
Process	5	Teaching learning process	3,73	Very Good
	6	Supervisory	3,58	Very Good

Evaluation	No	Dimension	Score	Category
Mean of process			3,65	Very Good
Output	7	Graduate competency	3,34	Very Good
Mean of output			3,34	Very Good
Mean of evaluation			3,45	Very Good

e. Teachers Education of Islamic Elementary School

TEIES receives a status grade of "excellent" with a score of 3.53 as shown in Table 5. Each dimension reveals very good status. The result is parallel with accreditation from BAN-PT that is A.

Table 5. Results of evaluation of TEIES

Evaluation	No	Dimension	Score	Category
Input	1	Vision and mission	3,96	Very Good
	2	Curriculum	3,42	Very Good
	3	Lecturer & staff	3,83	Very Good
	4	Infrastructure & facilities	3,40	Very Good
Mean of Input			3,75	Very Good
Process	5	Teaching learning process	3,45	Very Good
	6	Supervisory	3,55	Very Good
Mean of process			3,94	Very Good
Output	7	Graduate competency	3,40	Very Good
Mean of output			3,40	Very Good
Mean of evaluation			3,53	Very Good

f. Indonesian Language Education Unit

Indonesian Language Education (ILE) Unit is a preliminary form of Study Program yet to produce graduate students. The evaluation, therefore, is applied to six dimensions as no student has graduated from ILE. Table 6 shows that ILE receives an excellent status with score 3.63.

Table 6. Result of evaluation of Indonesian Language Education Unit

Evaluation	No	Dimension	Score	Category
Input	1	Vision and mission	4	Very Good
	2	Curriculum	3,32	Very Good
	3	Lecturer & staff	4	Very Good
	4	Infrastructure & facilities	3,64	Very Good
Mean of Input			3,74	Very Good
Process	5	Teaching learning process	3,30	Very Good
	6	Supervisory	3,75	Very Good
Mean of process			3,52	Very good
Output	7	Graduate competency	-	-
Mean of output			-	-
Mean of evaluation			3,63	Very Good

2. Projecting Readiness of FITK to Prepare Professional Teachers

Drawing the quality of each department in FITK, we can evaluate how much the FITK has prepared its program in order to produce qualified teachers. This section analyzes and elaborates the readiness of the whole study programs along with their units.

In general, all study programs are consistent in achieving the right management and administrative process. Documents that regulate lecturers and employees are complete, including recruitment, employment contract for prospective lecturers and employees. Documents pertaining to curriculum, student supervisory, and graduate competency have been properly sorted out and well archived. Our findings evidently prove that FITK is ready to train and prepare professional teachers. The following dimensions, indicates how ready the institutions are:

The first dimension is vision and mission of the program. We have already revealed that all 6 study programs have defined their vision and mission right away, with all having a status of very good. This means that the FITK readiness to prepare professional teachers capable of internalizing Islamic educational values have been defined prior to the implementation of the program. Vision and mission of the study programs have been well defined accommodating to the needs of Islamic professional teachers.

The second dimension, curriculum, has been defined as having a status of "very good", starting from the design and criteria section of the curriculum. Indicators that received very good status is capable of carrying out all study programs as devised by the National Framework Curriculum and as stipulated by the government in 2015. The National Curriculum Framework, and the faculty have invariably defined the main concerns: goals, objectives, and learning outcomes of the graduates. Each study program reviews its curriculum once in every 3 years. The curriculum coverage ensures that the learning outcomes meet the criteria and skills of each program, number of credit course is to be completed in 7 to 8 semesters, with an assurance to equip students with life skills and academic competency, academic literacy, and student development supervisory. As it is with Islamic institutions, the curriculum also set the Islamic moral values and reading Al Quran as the basic competency. This happens to be the standardized content of teaching and learning students of higher education as demanded by the government.

The fourth dimension is the competency of lecturers and administrative staff. Each study program has recruited competence lecturer and staff. The first standard that the qualification of a lecturer is a master's degree holder has been 100% asserted. In implementing a career development, each study program encourages the lecturers to further their education to doctorate degree program. By 2018, each study program has had 30% of its lecturers with doctorate degrees. In addition to this, staffs with the right qualification have been recruited into the relevant fields. Asides that, four general competencies have been placed that the lecturer must attain, Islamic competency indicating the Islamic institution are present as mandatory.

The fifth dimension deals with infrastructure and facilities. Infrastructure that are the main facilities of campus, such as halls for rector, dean, rooms for students in each faculty, stadium general, has been prepared in good quality. Rooms for teaching and learning as well as laboratories are available. Support facilities to run the academic atmosphere are also ready to use. Facilities to conduct student activities either for supervisory or individual programs have also been set.

The sixth dimension is the teaching and learning process. Our finding shows that the teaching and learning process has been assured to be conducted using straight procedures. Syllabi, lesson plan, assessment and evaluation, contract of lecture area all

pre-defined techniques used before teaching commences. To ensure the materials are well and evenly distributed, the faculty takes complete control, performing 16 meetings in a semester. The teaching plans must be online and at the post teaching process, the final score representing formative test, quiz, assignment, project and final exam must be published online in the faculty's website.

The seventh dimension is graduate competency. The graduate competency indicates how relevant it is to obtain high degree so that graduates of FITK are confident and employable. The criteria involved in doing this are described in the graduate competency and have been identified in the profiles of graduates. However, two problems pertaining to graduate competency were identified. Firstly, the faculty does not serve Tracer Study analysis to portray graduates that perform the competency right way. Secondly, graduates that are evaluated are those who have been certified and declared fit to complete their study. However, records obtained from alumni center, inventory of graduates have supplied objective information pertaining the quality of graduate competence.

E. Conclusion and Implication

This study summarizes two findings. Firstly, six study programs of FITK are qualified as very good programs. These programs include seven dimensions made up of: vision and mission, curriculum, lecturer and staff competency, infrastructure and facilities, teaching learning process, student development supervisory, and graduate competency perform very good quality. In addition to this, FITK being the main aim of this study programs also receives very good status. Secondly, each dimension suggests that vision and mission has been elaborated in the implementation of input, process and output rigorously. The findings obtained, admits that FITK and its six study programs have been set from the beginning to serve professional teachers. The overall evaluation shows that the process of attaining professional teachers will be successfully gained if the process is done by FITK and its study program.

This study, however, is limited by the dilemma experienced in recruiting respondents to measure the competence graduates and to ideally measure how well the evaluation output is associated with the input and evaluation process. However, there was enough time to track and collect data from graduates scattered and working in various institutions. In summary FITK improves the Tracer Study and alumni center. Future research will improve selection of graduate students, and implement considerable data collection to prevent bias.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- BAN-PT (National Accreditation Body for Higher Education). (2002). *Guidelines for Internal Quality Assessment of Higher Education*. 2nd Edition. Jakarta: Ministry of National Education.
- Chinta, Ravi; Kebritchi, Mansureh & Ellias, Janelle. (2016). A conceptual framework for evaluating higher education institutions. *International Journal of Educational Management*. 30(6), 2016. doi: 10.1108/IJEM-09.20015-0120.
- Choiriyah, Siti. (2018). *Model Evaluasi Mutu Internal Program Studi Pendidikan Islam dalam Menghasilkan Guru Profesional*. Unpublished Dissertassion. Yogyakarta: Program Studi Penelitian dan Evaluasi Pendidikan, Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta.

- Fitri, Zainul Agus. (2016). Quality Assurance System between the Islamic University and the State University. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*. 2(2), doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v2i2.787>
- Kennedy, M. Mary. (2016). How Does Professional Development Improve Teaching?, *Review of Educational Research*, 86(4), pp. 945-980. doi: 10.3102/0034654315616800.
- Koslowski, F.A. (2006). Quality and Assessment in Context. *Quality Assurance in Education*, 14(3), pp. 277-288. <https://doi.org/10.1108/09684880610678586>
- OECD/Asian Development Bank. (2015). *Education in Indonesia: Rising to the Challenges*. Paris: OECD Publishing.
- Patil, S. Arun & Pudlowski, J. Zenon. (2005). Important Issues of the Accreditation and Quality Assurance and a Strategy in the Development of Accreditation Framework for Engineering Course. *Global Journal of Engineering Education*. 9(1).
- Richards, J. C. (Eds.). (2015). *Key Issues in Language Teaching*. United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press
- Rich, B.L., Lepine, J.A. and Crawford, E.R. (2010). Job engagement: antecedents and effects on job performance, *Academy of Management Journal*, 53(3), 2010.
- Rita, Rezaee & Shokrpour, Nasrin. (2011). Performance Assessment of Academic Departments: CIPP Model. *European Journal of Social Sciences*, 23(2), 2011
- Rossi, P.H., Lipsey, M.W., & Freeman, H.E. (2004). *Evaluation: A systematic approach*(7thed.).CA: Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Tam, Maureen. (2001). *Assessing Quality in Higher Education by Examining the Effects of University Experiences on Learning Outcomes and Student Development*. PhD's Dissertation. University of Durham. Stockton, Durham City, UK.
- Zhang, Jianxin & Patil, Jagannath. (2017). Who guarantees the quality of the quality assurance agencies? The exploration of the establishment and growth of the Asia-Pacific Quality Register (APQR), *Higher Education Evaluation and Development*, 11(2), pp.58-67, <https://doi.org/10.1108/HEED-07-2017-0001>