Utilitarianism In Halal Tourism Development In Indonesia

Lukman Santoso

1Institut Agama Islam Negeri Ponorogo, Indonesia

Abstract
Halal tourism is one of the fastest-growing areas in the world economy. As a Muslim-majority country, Indonesia has the potential to promote halal tourism. However, there are still many problems in the development of halal tourism to realize sustainable benefits and the welfare of the people. This study aims to explore the development of halal tourism in Indonesia from a helpful philosophical perspective. By using a qualitative-interpretative approach, this study employed a library research method. This study provides findings that the development of halal tourism in Indonesia has not given the maximum benefit and welfare impact. Therefore, in the future, in formulating tourism development policies, it is essential to prioritize integrative and responsive aspects by involving all stakeholders and aligning them with the sustainable national development framework. The contribution of this study seeks to present regulatory formulations that have a positive impact on many people and rely on rule utilitarianism. Thus, it will give birth to a halal tourism policy that is inclusive, humane, and contextual to national and global dynamics.

Keywords: Utilitarianism, halal tourism, sustainability

* Corresponding author. Email: cak_luk@iainponorogo.ac.id
Introduction

In recent decades, tourism has become the world's leading sector. In Indonesia, current tourism is also a development driver that can accelerate economic growth, earn foreign exchange, and absorb labor.¹ Tourism is also one of the priority sectors for developing the work cabinet, infrastructure, maritime, energy, and food.² The Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy also mentioned that in 2018 the tourism sector became the second largest foreign exchange contributor, 15 million US dollars or around IDR 203 trillion after crude palm oil exports reached 17 billion US dollars. Meanwhile, in 2019, tourism became the first foreign exchange contributor, which was 20 billion US dollars. Furthermore, in 2018, the Indonesian tourism index was also ranked 30th globally.³

Related to the development of the tourism sector, one of the segments that is becoming a global trend along with the development of the halal industry is Muslim-friendly tourism. Countries such as Japan, Germany, South Korea, Singapore, Qatar, Thailand, and Malaysia have even started.⁴ Meanwhile, in Indonesia, Muslim-friendly

---


⁴ Hilda Rahmah and Hanry Harlen Tapotubun, “Narasi Industri Pariwisata Halal Di Jepang Dan Jerman,” Jurnal
tourism began to develop in mid-2015 by setting 10 priority tourist destinations through Sharia tourism terminology. The term halal tourism began to be used in 2017 to replace Sharia tourism because the branding was considered too exclusive.

An international conference titled "Strengthening Islamic Economy Through Halal Tourism: Challenges, Opportunities, and Prospects," held in Lombok in 2018, has also formulated that halal tourism is a distinguishing feature of Indonesia's economic development. The forum also places halal tourism as a potential sector in the Sharia economy's development as a foreign exchange source.

Ratni Primalika's research stated that there was a significant and positive influence related to the attitude or behavior of destination managers on the satisfaction of Muslim tourists and the influence of the satisfaction of Muslim tourists on destination loyalty. The research by

---


7 Ratni Primalita, “Attitude, Islamic Tourist Satisfaction dan Destination Loyalty: Dasar Untuk Mengembangkan Halal Tourism
Baiq Mustika Sari et al. states that Muslim identity affects the application of halal certificates. At the same time, socialization and awareness affect the application of halal certificates.  

Halal tourism in Indonesia is experiencing an anomaly in its development. There are pros and cons in some areas. Some continue to wriggle, for example, West Nusa Tenggara, Riau, West Sumatra, Konawe Islands, Jakarta, and West Java. However, resistance to halal tourism is also not small, as happened in Lake Toba, Labuan Bajo, East Nusa Tenggara, Toraja, Bali, and others that continue to reject halal tourism.

Fauzan al-Mansyur et al. emphasized that the branding of halal tourist destinations was rejected, which
was stated explicitly even though the government has made policies and promoted the branding of halal tourist destinations.\textsuperscript{13}

This indicates that there are still problems in the development of halal tourism in Indonesia. According to several researchers, apart from not having a sustainable vision and being responsive to localities, halal tourism has not maximally provided an effect on increasing welfare for the community.\textsuperscript{14} A study by the \textit{ASEAN Study Center UGM}, Muhaddam Faham, and Surwandono et al. also mentioned problems regarding regulations, human resources, and institutions.\textsuperscript{15}

Halal tourism in Indonesia has given a choice between hedonism (attitude) or utilitarianism (behavior) for market share and tourist destinations. However, branding halal tourism as an option for the tourism segment is still limited to touching attitudes (hedonism) but not behavior (utilitarianism).\textsuperscript{16} This is because what marketers have


\textsuperscript{16} Mahsun Mahsun and Mohamad Jumail, “Branding ‘Halal Tourism’ Antara Hedonisme Dan Utilitarianisme Pariwisata Lombok,” \textit{Media
given is currently limited to attitude. The problem then is when the attitude choice has been formed into behavior. However, if the readiness of the destination to provide halal products and services is not ready, this can threaten the competitiveness and sustainability of tourism itself. Hedonic behavior is a phenomenon of tourism activities known as the nature of tourism itself. So, there may be a conflict between the structure of halal tourism and hedonic behavior. This fundamental problem needs to be solved through integrated and sustainable policies in forming halal behavior in the tourism industry.

This shows that the epistemological basis for developing halal tourism is not yet strong, whether it uses the paradigm of Halal Tourism, Islamic Tourism, Muslim Friendly Tourism, or even Muslim Religious Tourism, as well as how the value of halal tourism is not only for religion but also for society and the state.

Moreover, until now, the government has no law regulating halal tourism. The legal guidelines used as a national reference are limited to Fatwa DSN-MUI No.108/DSN-MUI/X/2016 concerning Guidelines for Implementing Tourism Based on Sharia Principles. The draft regulation on halal tourism has only appeared in the 2020-2024 Prolegnas through the Bill on Halal Tourism Destinations. Whereas amid the massive development of

---


the halal industry, it is crucial to form an umbrella regulation that can serve as a legal basis for realizing community welfare through the development of halal tourism. Therefore, the presented halal tourism regulations must substantively be a law that genuinely reflects the crystallization of values in society and the community’s legal needs.19

Based on the above background, this study focused on unraveling the utilitarianism paradigm in halal tourism development in Indonesia. Therefore, this study can recommend the development of halal tourism policies as an instrument of sustainable economic development in the region. At the same time, we are developing a halal tourism model that is responsive after the pandemic and in harmony with global dynamics.

This study employed a qualitative-interpretative approach with the method of literature. The data in this study were obtained from various works of literature that discuss the development of halal tourism in books, journals, research results, legal products, documents, news, and other relevant sources. This study meticulously delineated and elucidated the attributes of the subject matter, aiming to present a lucid, methodical, and empirical portrayal. Data sources were rigorously analyzed through qualitative methods, drawing from a range of pertinent literature. The data interpretation was anchored in a robust engagement with theoretical frameworks

pertinent to the research question, ensuring a comprehensive and informed analysis.

**Utilitarianism in the Context of Development**

Utilitarianism is part of moral and political philosophy in which the general good or social welfare is the only ethical or good value that must be pursued as much as possible.²⁰ Jeremy Bentham²¹ and John Stuart Mill²² are the central figures of this theory. As an ethical theory, the core idea of utilitarianism is how much action will have an impact. More specifically, the only impact of the relevant action is the good and bad results. Utilitarians think morality is justified by its positive contribution to people and the world around them.²³

Since the late 18th century, economists have generally supported hedonistic utilitarianism. Economists use several versions of utilitarianism (classical and nonclassical) as analytical instruments. As Kenneth Arrow puts it: ‘The implicit ethical basis of economic policy judgments is some version of utilitarian theory.’ The utilitarian argument is commonly used to advocate for institutional or policy change.²⁴

In its development, utilitarianism currently appears in various modified formulations. Bentham’s ideals of hedonic calculus are commonly considered practical if not a theoretical impossibility. In the twentieth century, philosophers noticed a further problem in utilitarian procedure. One, for example, is identifying the consequences of an action. This process raises conceptual and practical issues about what should be counted as consequences without accurately measuring the value. For example, the question may arise as to whether the outcome of an election is a result of every vote cast for the winning candidate if that person receives more than the amount required for the election, and, in estimating the value of the consequence, one may be asked whether the entire value or only part of the value of the election result to be awarded for each vote.25

This issue, however, is expected in almost all normative ethical theories, as most of them recognize the consequences – including hedonic consequences – of action as a relevant ethical consideration. The central insight of utilitarianism that one should put happiness first and prevent unhappiness whenever possible is undeniable. However, the critical question is whether the entirety of normative ethics can be analyzed in this simple formula.26

Two streams of utilitarianism have been widely recognized. The appropriate action, according to the flow of act utilitarianism, is the one that delivers the best result. According to the flow of rule utilitarianism, the correct rule is the rule that produces the best consequences. Laws often


reflect rule utilitarianism: laws are chosen to deliver the best outcomes. This flow is often used to measure how much regulations impact many people.\(^{27}\)

The principle or law surrounding non-discrimination is an example. Therefore, halal tourism regulations should ideally complete the service of tourist destinations because there are more segments to choose from. Instead of being a barrier and exclusive, other people cannot access the facilities that might benefit more from it.

**Utilitarianism in the Context of Halal Tourism Policy**

In the context of advancing halal tourism in Indonesia, it is feasible and advantageous to integrate two distinct strands of utilitarianism synergistically. Richard Hare, the father of contemporary utilitarianism, claimed that moral reasoning takes place on two levels: intuitive and critical. Therefore, moving between these levels is required, depending on the circumstances. This makes it possible to act efficiently in everyday life.\(^{28}\)

In connection with the development of halal tourism,\(^{29}\) this policy is determined by the motive for implementing political affairs and the functions of society and a country's economy. The halal tourism policy is an interaction between religion (Islam) and tourism that is of value to authorities, industry, academics, and local


communities in both the Muslim and non-Muslim worlds.\textsuperscript{30}

Furthermore, Zamani et al. outline the need to analyze Muslim tourists' motivation expectations and experiences. An impact analysis covering environmental, economic, and socio-cultural issues.

In the context of halal tourism in Indonesia, the suggestion of Zamani et al. above is explicitly contextually applied to analyze the readiness of destinations to deliver halal tourism products and services based on consumer hedonism and functionalism (utilitarianism). For long-term goals, the customer hedonism aspect becomes a relevant alternative. Halal tourism, with utilitarianism, is also an effective and efficient choice for short-term purposes.\textsuperscript{31}

Referring to the two findings above, the next question that needs to be raised is one of the rules of thumb used in utilitarianism, namely the most significant number (other things being equal). This rule can be applied to questions about development by assessing how many people will benefit when the policy is implemented or not implemented. This can also be used for triage questions: in practice, this means considering the following variables:

\textit{Probability}

In a context where halal tourism has an economic recovery potential of 90\%, while non-halal tourism is only 10\%, the option to adopt a halal tourism policy becomes very relevant, especially in areas with a majority Muslim population such as Lombok, West Sumatra, and Aceh.


\textsuperscript{31} Mahsun and Jumail, “Branding ‘Halal Tourism’ Antara Hedonisme Dan Utilitarianisme Pariwisata Lombok.”
These regions have shown initiatives in developing halal tourism, such as halal culinary in West Sumatra, halal lodging facilities in Lombok, and the utilization of Aceh's local identity with its Islamic law regulations. This shows an understanding of the importance of probability in outcome-orientated policymaking.

**Duration**

The longer the policy effect, the more people potentially benefit, the more relevant the policy. Destinations such as Gayo customs in Aceh, rendang cuisine in West Sumatra, the natural beauty of Mount Rinjani and Gili Trawangan in Lombok, Mount Bromo in East Java, and others each have unique natural and cultural potential. Policies for sustainable tourism and environmental preservation in these areas have a profound long-term impact. Maintaining these destinations' ecological balance and sustainability ensures their continued appeal for future generations and supports the local economy. The longer these policies are effectively implemented, the broader the benefits.

**Resources**

The more resources used, the less available for others. In this context, tourist destinations such as Gili Trawangan, indigenous villages, traditional halal cuisine, and others face a crucial challenge. The limited natural resources in these destinations, such as the Harau Valley in West Sumatra or the natural preservation of Mount Rinjani, are precious. Excessive or irresponsible use can damage these ecosystems, reduce their aesthetic and biological value, and ultimately reduce their attractiveness as tourist destinations. Hence, it is imperative to meticulously steward these finite natural resources to
guarantee their availability for both the present generation and those to come.

From a social and economic perspective, unsustainable resource management can adversely affect local communities. Therefore, a sustainable and thoughtful approach to using natural resources is vital in balancing tourism development and environmental sustainability.

Sustainability

According to utilitarianism, how long benefits are enjoyed is essential - it affects the goods produced. Destinations such as Baiturrahman Grand Mosque in Aceh, Sianok Gorge in West Sumatra, Gili Tramena in Lombok, and Mount Bromo are priorities with high aesthetic, cultural, and ecological values. If managed with utilitarianism, the focus is not only on short-term profits from tourism but also on maintaining and preserving these resources for long-term enjoyment.

The lasting benefits of sustainable policies in these destinations include natural beauty and cultural preservation and sustainable economic gains for local communities. In the view of utilitarianism, this creates a more significant "sum of goods" in the form of sustainable benefits enjoyed by many over a more extended period.

Sustainability can be formulated through integrated halal tourism pentahelix collaboration involving various sectors and stakeholders. So, by presenting more participation of halal tourism stakeholders, tourism services are more sustainable and more prosperous for many people. As utilitarianism's core teaching, legal policy aims to provide the most significant benefit and happiness to as many citizens as possible.32

32 Anang Sutono et al., “The Implementation of Halal Tourism Ecosystem Model in Borobudur Temple as Tourism Area,”
According to Mulyani et al., stakeholder collaboration is needed to develop sustainable tourism. The expected achievements are at least comprehensively regulating natural destinations responsible for the sustainability of life, economic activities, and community welfare simultaneously. This halal tourism role model can be developed through ecotourism or tourism villages based on local wisdom, such as in Lombok, Aceh, or Bali.

When people think in ‘cool and quiet times,’ given all the facts, ‘critical level’ utilitarianism requires selecting the action that might maximize the good. Imagine a decision-maker who has perfect awareness of the result of all available options. In complex situations, where there is time, people should try to rise to a more reflective and careful critical level and ask what options should be supported. What exactly is the correct answer? Hare argues that in such situations, people should resort to acting utilitarianism.

According to utilitarianism, all consequences of actions, both short and long-term, direct or indirect, are relevant to decisions. Therefore, it may be relevant to consider not only the benefits to the person directly affected by an action (for example, by being placed on a ventilator)


Hare, Moral Thinking: Its Levels, Method and Point.
but also to others. This can be called 'social benefit' or social value.

Policies are often driven by politics or popular opinion, not ethics. This is morally wrong. Much of ethics in the public sphere involves social signaling, moralism, and sometimes wishful thinking (for example, trying to eliminate complex ethical dilemmas). People must confront the facts and principles to evaluate actions' ramifications carefully. The utilitarian approach is neither simple nor easy. This requires people to choose the course of action that is most beneficial to most people, however difficult or counterintuitive.

One of the psychological biases that dominate decision-making is loss aversion. The losses seem to outweigh the gains. Moreover, when a policy is being evaluated, people tend to focus on the negative instead of the positive. Therefore, governments like East Asian governments that radically limit freedom and protect health and safety are criticized for being too authoritarian. Liberal governments that protect freedom and pose a greater risk of infection (such as the UK and Australia) have been criticized for failing to protect vulnerable and safe public health. There is no victory in the court of public opinion.

Jeremy Bentham reviews pleasure as a marker of ethical correctness. Simultaneously, he introduces a hedonistic calculus to assess if the advantages gained from mining yield long-term or short-term benefits. This approach questions whether the enjoyment is fleeting, serving only the immediate interests of investors or the wider public. Addressing this query shifts the responsibility of justifying development beyond government authority to include scholars. This broader perspective emphasizes the
necessity of sustainable development, considering the broader needs of society.\textsuperscript{36}

For the government, halal tourism infrastructure is an absolute basis for economic development. The infrastructure development is based on the belief and utility calculation that the policy will significantly impact many people in the long run. The development of the tourism sector through halal tourism branding is intended to answer questions regarding social inequality and provide economic calculations. In other words, from an economic perspective, this is called wealth maximization. Wealth or welfare maximization is an ethical concept intended to improve the economy and its impact. Maximizing wealth means maximizing utility. It is intended to provide more significant benefits.

The general ethical value of utilitarianism in development is welfare. What matters to everyone is how well lives go. This is the essence and foundation of utilitarianism: it requires an approach that does not favor the welfare of everyone but the public. While some may argue that other factors (autonomy, privacy, and dignity) are more critical, everyone can agree on the importance of well-being.

**Halal Tourism Development in Post-Pandemic Regional Development**

To respond to the global trend of halal tourism development, the Government of Indonesia, through the

Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy since 2013, has set priority destinations for Muslim-friendly tourism with the diction of Sharia tourism. Then, in 2015, the government reinforced the vision of developing Muslim-friendly tourism with "halal tourism" diction and set up ten leading halal tourism destinations. Lombok, popularly known as the island of a thousand mosques, became the first area and a national halal tourism pilot destination. Lombok also received two awards in the World Halal Tourism Award (WHTA) in Abu Dhabi in the categories of World Best Halal Destination and World Best Halal Honeymoon.

Halal tourism development has increasingly gained momentum after the Covid-19 pandemic. Based on an assessment from The Global Travel Muslim Index (GMTI), after being ranked 4th under Saudi Arabia in 2021, 2022 Indonesia rose to 2nd place under Malaysia. It was ranked 1st in 2023 ahead of 138 countries. Assessment as the world's best halal tourist destination is based on ease of access, communication, environment, and service indicators. Of these indicators, the service indicator is

an essential point because it relates to the availability of accommodation services, transportation, halal food, guarantee of healthy and hygienic food, worship facilities, and Islamic financial services that are friendly to Muslim tourists.

This is relevant to the results of the International Halal Congress initiated by the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI) on 14-15 June 2022 in Bangka Belitung, which has agreed on nine (9) world halal resolutions. One of the essential points is related to efforts to develop halal tourism in Indonesia, namely increasing the acceleration of the development of the halal industry and halal tourism as an essential pillar of national and global economic growth after the pandemic.40 The government projects that tourism can become the most significant contributor to foreign exchange, increase investment, and absorb labor.41

The pandemic is essential in shaping public awareness of health issues, which is relevant to halal behavior in this case. The trend of increasing demand for halal products with various variants during the pandemic and post-pandemic is undeniable. This further triggers how to develop the halal issue as a universal issue, including in the tourism sector. This means that the issue of halal tourism is not limited to religion but rather makes halal an inclusive health and hospitality issue regardless of religion.42

42 Noveri Maulana, Restia Oktaviann, and Yasmine Farah, “Hygiene From The Heart: The Rise of Sharia Compliant Hotel in Indonesia After Covid-19 Pandemic,” JEBIS (Jurnal Ekonomi Dan Bisnis Islam) 6, no. 2 (December 11, 2020): 221-38,
According to Riyanto Sofyan, the COVID-19 pandemic has shaped a global tourism megatrend with characteristics to humanize humans (humanization), namely caring for the environment and tourism that prioritizes human health. This aligns with halal tourism, which has a foothold in maintaining manners, prioritizing health, caring for the environment, promoting local wisdom, and running sustainable tourism.\(^{43}\)

The halal concept prioritizes health and safety in line with the CHSE (Cleanliness, Health, Safety, Environmental Sustainability) protocol, which the government prepared to revive and increase tourist confidence in national tourism. Therefore, the new regular pattern and travel style in the current era are part of halal tourism's substance.\(^{44}\)

This condition is the right momentum to reformulate halal tourism regulations, which have been limited to branding and focus on the economic dimension of capital so far. To then be reframed, thus, the perception of halal tourism, which is still understood to be exclusive, turns into inclusive and has more impact on welfare. Therefore, it opens up opportunities for non-Muslim tourists to experience halal tourism. This is an opportunity for Indonesian tourism to rise faster.

The paradigm shift in tourism development after the pandemic is essential. So far, the tourism development paradigm still refers to the modernization and economic growth model. Modernization tends not to respect, forget, discard, or be hostile to traditions rich in local knowledge

---


and wisdom. Modernization tends to sacrifice and burden future generations by polluting the environment and destroying ecosystems, threatening natural resources. Through large-scale industrialization, economic development impacts the marginalization of people’s economic efforts, which are the legacy of a long tradition.45

The Indonesian government has so far set 10 priority tourist destinations in the development of halal tourism, namely Aceh, West Sumatra, Riau, Special Capital Region of Jakarta, West Java, Special Region of Yogyakarta, Central Java, East Java, West Nusa Tenggara, and South Sulawesi.46 For these priority areas to become global tourist destinations, halal tourism development in Indonesia must focus on sustainable tourism in the context of inclusive regional development. Development in urban areas is oriented towards providing essential services and improving healthy urban ecosystems that impact human welfare. Sustainable development in rural areas is oriented towards providing a sustainable agricultural ecosystem. For the complete realization of sustainable halal tourism, it is essential to harmonize three key pillars: social equality, economic growth, and environmental protection. This balanced approach is crucial for positively influencing community welfare and fostering regional progress.

Various regional regulations have also underpinned the policy framework. The West Nusa Tenggara provincial government formed NTB Governor Regulation No. 51 of 2015 concerning the implementation of halal tourism, which was later elevated to a regional regulation through

NTB Provincial Regulation No. 2 of 2016 concerning Halal Tourism as a legal umbrella policy. This tactical step of the NTB government can at least be interpreted as a utilitarianism-oriented policy.

Other regions such as West Sumatra, Aceh, Riau, West Java, Banjarmasin, and others also have regional regulations and policies. West Sumatra has prepared an academic study since 2016, and in mid-2020, it passed the Halal Tourism Regional Regulation. Likewise, Siak Regency in Riau formed a regional regulation in 2017, followed by the Riau Province Halal Tourism Governor Regulation in 2019. Then, Muara Enim, Aceh Jaya, and Konawe Islands regencies also formed local regulations.

---

47 Some legal products that have been successfully formed by the West Sumatra government to support halal tourism are: 1) West Sumatra Provincial Regulation Number 14 of 2019 concerning Amendments to West Sumatra Regional Regulation Number 3 of 2014 concerning RIPPARDA of West Sumatra Province 2014-2025; 2) West Sumatra Regional Regulation No. 1 of 2020 concerning the implementation of Halal Tourism; 3) West Sumatra Governor Regulation No. 19 of 2022 concerning Regulations on the Implementation of Regional Regulation No. 1 of 2020 concerning the Implementation of Halal Tourism.

48 Several legal products that have been successfully formed by the Riau government to support halal tourism, namely: 1) Riau Governor Regulation No 18 of 2019 on halal tourism; 2) Regional Regulation of Siak Regency No. 2 of 2017 concerning Halal Tourism; 3) Decree of the Mayor of Pekanbaru No. 59 of 2019 concerning the Determination of Halal Tourism Acceleration Zones in Pekanbaru City.

49 Muara Enim Regency Regional Regulation No 15 of 2019 concerning Halal Tourism.

50 Some legal products that have been successfully formed by the Aceh government to support halal tourism in Aceh are: 1) Qanun No 8 of 2013 concerning tourism; 2) MPU Fatwa No 07 of 2014 concerning Tourism in Islamic View; 3) Aceh Jaya District Qanun No 10 of 2019 concerning halal tourism; 4) Perwali Banda Aceh City No 17 of 2016 concerning the Implementation of Halal Tourism.
in 2019.\textsuperscript{51} Aceh, Banjarmasin, and West Java have actively engaged with this trend,\textsuperscript{52} having been in the process of formulating halal tourism regulations since 2018.

Based on these various existing regulations, each region has advantages based on regional characteristics in spurring the utilitarianism of halal tourism development.\textsuperscript{53} Each region requires a different approach to accommodate diverse communities with different norms and customs.\textsuperscript{54} For example, Aceh has an advantage in institutionalizing the regional halal tourism acceleration team and effective law enforcement with Wilayatul Hisbah. Second, West Sumatera has advantages in terms of comprehensive regulations adopting local wisdom and specialized local regulation enforcement institutions, for example, the content material of Minang customs and the existence of a friendly Tourism Police. Third, Riau and the Islands have the advantage of establishing halal tourism zoning and providing annual rewards for districts/cities in developing halal tourist destinations. Fourth, West Java has advantages in terms of the commitment of regional leaders,

\begin{itemize}
  \item Konawe Islands Regency Regional Regulation No 9 of 2019 concerning Halal Tourism
  \item Some legal products that have been successfully formed by the West Java government to support halal tourism are: 1) Regional Regulation No. 15 of 2015 concerning RIPPARDA West Java Year 2015-2025; 2) West Java Halal Tourism Guidelines 2019; 3) Regional Regulation of Bandung Regency No. 6 of 2020 concerning halal tourism.
\end{itemize}
a phasing model in the application, and synergy between stakeholders, for example, creating a Halal Tourism Guidebook as a guideline for all stakeholders and MoUs with multi-stakeholders in developing halal tourism. Fifth, East Java has advantages in aspects of the halal industrial area, creative collaboration, and multiplatform IOT-based halal tourism, as exemplified by Malang, Banyuwangi, and Jombang.55

Furthermore, to realize individual and community happiness, the policy must achieve four objectives: (1) to provide subsistence (to provide a living); (2) to provide abundance (to provide a living with abundant food); (3) to provide security (to provide protection); and (4) to attain equity (to achieve equality). Halal tourism policy is a multi-sectoral as well as multi-regional policy. Therefore, a sustainable and integrated halal tourism policy formulation is needed. Thus, in the view of utilitarianism, sustainable halal tourism is tourism that is increasingly preserved, more prosperous, and universally beneficial.

As said by Baharuddin, the concept of halal tourism contains a profound meaning, namely healthy and safety. Because quality material conditions make something lawful, thus, it has a utility impact on the public good. Meanwhile, commodification, politicization, and capitalization will damage the halal substance itself.56 In the study of structuralism, the phrase ‘halal tourism’ can

be examined more deeply in terms of its meaning.\textsuperscript{57} Community adaptation after the COVID-19 pandemic has encouraged a shift from quantity-oriented tourism development to quality tourism, such as halal tourism. The development of quality tourism in the context of utilitarianism can be encouraged in several aspects. It increases tourism competitiveness, unique experiences, and high-value and sustainable tourism.

Widjojo Nitisastro said that economic development should not deny the values of humanity and justice. Economic growth is crucial for a country, especially in global economic competition. However, improving human quality through development in health and education is far more critical. Therefore, development within the framework of Pancasila has a grand goal, namely, the creation of social justice. In this case, the state must ensure that no one is neglected and marginalized (no one left behind) by the current development.\textsuperscript{58}

The basic foundation of halal tourism development is the availability of solid regulations. Halal tourism regulation is a legal form with the character of the community's legal needs. This regulation can also be a practical legal umbrella for local governments to realize the community's welfare. Therefore, regional regulations must substantively become laws that genuinely reflect the crystallization of societal values and the community's legal needs.\textsuperscript{59} In utilitarianism, regulation exists not only for


\textsuperscript{59} Sidik Sunaryo, “Pemahaman Masyarakat Terhadap Hukum Lokal (Studi Pemahaman Masyarakat Terhadap Perda Tentang Retribusi
itself but for something bigger and broader. Thus, whenever a problem is related to policy, the regulation is reviewed and corrected comprehensively.60

The presence of the law has to provide the most significant benefit and happiness to as many people as possible. Thus, the concept puts benefit as the primary goal of the law. The criterion is that as many people as possible be as happy as feasible. The determination of a law's righteousness or fairness hinges on its ability to deliver happiness to people. Regulations that succeed in bringing joy to the majority of society are deemed justifiable and reasonable. In other words, the existence of the state and law is solely a tool to achieve the essential benefits, namely the happiness of as many people as possible. This is why tourism policies must positively impact tourists and tourism actors and ensure sustainable welfare for the whole world.

Regarding development policies, Ifrani stated that development policies should not only aim to pursue economic growth. Instead, they must continue to pay attention to the human rights of citizens under the mandate of the 1945 Constitution, namely social justice, which contains three main elements: economic rights, social rights, and culture.61 Therefore, in formulating halal tourism policies, the government should pay attention to economic interests, social rights, and culturally friendly policies.

---

60 Sutono et al., “The Implementation of Halal Tourism Ecosystem Model in Borobudur Temple as Tourism Area.”
The Direction of Halal Tourism Policy from a Utilitarian Perspective

According to Ifrani, the formulation of effective policies in the field of economic law must at least include five main components: stability, predictability, fairness, education, and the extraordinary development abilities of the lawyer.62 In terms of formulating sustainable halal tourism policies based on the explanation above, at least the direction of halal tourism policies should ideally use the following pattern:

---

Figure 1: Model of Halal Tourism Policy from a Utilitarian Perspective

- **Pancasila**
- **Development Policy**
  - **Economic**
    - stability, predictability
  - **Probability & Duration**
  - **Utilitarianism**
    - Regulation of Halal Tourism Policy in
  - **Social and Culture**
    - fairness, education, and the special development
  - **Resources & Policy Sustainability**
Based on the above scheme, the researcher proposes the following directions for the halal tourism policy in Indonesia. First, the state basis of Pancasila must be a frame of mind and perspective in every regulation. Second, the framework is integrated with Indonesia’s development policies or directions, as stated in the 2020-2024 National Medium-Term Plan. Third, development policies that have been synchronized are then directed to the fulfillment of citizens’ human rights in the form of economic, social, and cultural rights. The fulfillment of economic rights in policies must consider stability and predictability.

In contrast, the fulfillment of social and cultural rights must consider aspects of fairness, education, and the extraordinary development abilities of the lawyer. Furthermore, the government can adopt the policy formulation variables proposed by Hare and West to formulate policies that include all of the above elements.

To fulfill the stability and predictability aspects proposed, measuring based on probability theory by predicting how much people are affected in an area and measuring the impact duration. For example, the government can measure the number of people affected by the implementation of halal tourism policies by making predictions based on indicators of economic actors in an area and how they can enjoy the implementation of halal tourism in their area.

64 Savulescu, Persson, and Wilkinson, “Utilitarianism and the Pandemic.”
65 Hare, Moral Thinking: Its Levels, Method and Point; R. West, “Effects Of Utilitarianism In Other Fields.”
Furthermore, to fulfill aspects of fairness, education, and the extraordinary development abilities of the lawyer, the government can measure the quality and quantity of resources and how sustainable halal tourism policies are if implemented in an area. Therefore, it has implications for maximum welfare. As stated by Santoso & Cahyani in their study in East Java, halal tourism development can boost regional potential while strengthening sustainable development. The study also mentions that the development of halal tourism in Malang and Banyuwangi has variations and diversity in implementing pentahelix collaboration. Each region has advantages supported by multi-sector and multi-stakeholder institutions that complement each other. Halal tourism development in Malang and Banyuwangi also seeks to ensure it remains in harmony with local wisdom.

In utilitarianism, the public good or social welfare is the only ethical value or goal that should be pursued as much as possible. As an ethical theory, the core idea of utilitarianism is how much an action will have an impact. More specifically, the only relevant effects of actions are the good and bad outcomes of the actions performed. Utilitarians think that what makes morality right or justifiable is its positive contribution to people and the environment. And this is relevant to the substance of halal tourism. So, the decision to justify halal tourism is not

---


67 Santoso and Cahyani, “Pentahelix’s Collaboration In The Development of Halal Tourism For Sustainable Regional Economic Development.”

merely the government's authority but also experts and
thinkers who can see the broader benefits for society,
namely sustainable development.\(^69\)

John Stuart Mill gave 2 (two) actual interpretations
of utilitarianism. First, he criticized Bentham's view that
pleasure and happiness should be measured quantitatively. Instead, he argues that their quality needs
to be considered as well because there are pleasures that
are higher in quality and those that are lower. Secondly,
the happiness that becomes the ethical norm is everyone
involved in an event, not the happiness of just one person
who may act as the leading actor.\(^70\)

Finally, the potential for developing Indonesia's halal
tourism industry is promising and can accelerate regional
development. However, as a service-oriented industry, it is
vulnerable to risk. Because, after all, risk is a consequence
that is not expected and consumers want to avoid when
buying and using a service product. As Olya and al-Ansi
said, risk factors affect customer satisfaction and intention
to purchase halal products and services in the tourism
industry.\(^71\) Risks related to facilities and services in tourist
destinations include non-compliance of business actors
with halal standards, lack of halal-certified products,
inadequate prayer and ablution facilities, poor destination

\(^{69}\) Ahmad Sahidah, “Kezaliman Penguasa dan Utilitarianisme”,

\(^{70}\) John Stuart Mill, \textit{Utilitarismane} (Yogyakarta: BasaBasi, 2020);
Endang Pratiwi, Theo Negoro, and Hassanain Haykal, “Teori
Utilitarianisme Jeremy Bentham: Tujuan Hukum Atau Metode
Pengujuan Produk Hukum?,” \textit{Jurnal Konstitusi} 19, no. 2 (June 2,

\(^{71}\) Hossein G.T. Olya and Amr Al-anzi, “Risk Assessment of
Halal Products and Services: Implication for Tourism
Industry,” \textit{Tourism Management} 65 (April 2018): 279–91,
infrastructure and security, less attractive attractions to visitors, and several other things.

The risk of halal tourism can also arise regarding understanding and acceptance of the local culture, which all visitors do not fully understand. In addition, the use of the term "halal tourism" may also limit the target market, reducing the possibility of attracting non-halal tourists, who may have significant economic potential. Risks will also arise due to political and social succession in implementing and maintaining halal tourism policies. This happens especially if there is a change in leadership or political priorities. Therefore, it is crucial to understand and address the risks and challenges associated with halal tourism, such as ensuring compliance with halal principles, improving access and services, and developing a competitive halal sector. To minimize risks, communities, and stakeholders must balance the needs of Muslim and non-Muslim visitors.

Conclusion

Drawing from the analysis presented in the preceding subsection, it is evident that the evolution of halal tourism in Indonesia has yet to achieve its full potential in terms of delivering optimal benefits and enhancing societal welfare. Therefore, in the future, in formulating tourism development policies, it is crucial to prioritize integrative and responsive aspects by involving all stakeholders (business actors, private parties, government, et cetera) in line with the sustainable national development framework. By presenting regulations that aim to make people happy and rely on rule utilitarianism, it might produce halal

tourism policies that are inclusive and humanist, as well as contextual to national and global dynamics.

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**


Surwando, Surwando, Rizki Dian Nursita, Rashda Diana, and Ade Meiliyana. “Polemik Kebijakan Wisata


This page intentionally left blank.